



HOW SCIENCE HANDLES EXTRAORDINARY CLAIMS

Sucked
tual

DR. STEPHEN LAW

skeptiko.com

1
00:00:11,669 --> 00:00:09,190
on this episode of skeptico alex talks

2
00:00:14,709 --> 00:00:11,679
with philosopher and well-known atheist

3
00:00:15,829 --> 00:00:14,719
dr steven law author of believing

4
00:00:17,189 --> 00:00:15,839
[h__\h]

5
00:00:19,349 --> 00:00:17,199
how not to get sucked into an

6
00:00:21,109 --> 00:00:19,359
intellectual black hole here's the

7
00:00:22,790 --> 00:00:21,119
example that i sent you and i have

8
00:00:25,109 --> 00:00:22,800
personal experience with because he told

9
00:00:27,670 --> 00:00:25,119
it to me and we discussed it on this

10
00:00:30,150 --> 00:00:27,680
show and that's british psychologist and

11
00:00:32,790 --> 00:00:30,160
parapsychology critic richard wiseman

12
00:00:35,750 --> 00:00:32,800
who has investigated probably more of

13
00:00:37,670 --> 00:00:35,760

these paranormal parapsychology claims

14

00:00:40,150 --> 00:00:37,680

like telepathy than just about anybody

15

00:00:42,869 --> 00:00:40,160

else and here's his quote i agree that

16

00:00:45,430 --> 00:00:42,879

by the standards of any other area of

17

00:00:48,069 --> 00:00:45,440

science that remote viewing and he later

18

00:00:50,470 --> 00:00:48,079

added in this quote esp

19

00:00:52,470 --> 00:00:50,480

is proven but that begs the question do

20

00:00:55,189 --> 00:00:52,480

we need higher standards of evidence

21

00:00:57,270 --> 00:00:55,199

when we study the paranormal so stephen

22

00:00:59,590 --> 00:00:57,280

this is not the fairy in the cup over

23

00:01:01,750 --> 00:00:59,600

here this is a guy who's reviewed

24

00:01:03,990 --> 00:01:01,760

hundreds of peer-reviewed papers and

25

00:01:06,149 --> 00:01:04,000

saying good enough for any other field

26

00:01:10,469 --> 00:01:06,159

but you know what not good enough

27

00:01:13,429 --> 00:01:10,479

because of the groundbreaking upset it

28

00:01:15,270 --> 00:01:13,439

would make for science i think this is

29

00:01:17,990 --> 00:01:15,280

the best evidence i could give you for

30

00:01:22,230 --> 00:01:18,000

my claim about scientific materialism

31

00:01:24,149 --> 00:01:22,240

being woven into science as we know it

32

00:01:26,070 --> 00:01:24,159

i think what

33

00:01:27,670 --> 00:01:26,080

presumably you wouldn't accept you know

34

00:01:29,350 --> 00:01:27,680

if i stick my finger out there and there

35

00:01:31,190 --> 00:01:29,360

appears to be a finger sort of fairy

36

00:01:33,109 --> 00:01:31,200

spinning around on the end of it you're

37

00:01:34,550 --> 00:01:33,119

going to be very very suspicious you're

38

00:01:36,310 --> 00:01:34,560

not just going to say

39

00:01:38,149 --> 00:01:36,320

yeah stephen's proved to me that there

40

00:01:41,030 --> 00:01:38,159

are fairies ah

41

00:01:43,350 --> 00:01:41,040

you're going to require a much more

42

00:01:44,950 --> 00:01:43,360

investigation before you take my word

43

00:01:46,789 --> 00:01:44,960

for it that there really is a fairies uh

44

00:01:49,109 --> 00:01:46,799

spinning around on the end of my finger

45

00:01:50,149 --> 00:01:49,119

and why is that it's because

46

00:01:52,230 --> 00:01:50,159

you know

47

00:01:54,710 --> 00:01:52,240

the the prior probability that anything

48

00:01:57,109 --> 00:01:54,720

like a theory exists is very very low

49

00:01:58,469 --> 00:01:57,119

indeed knowing what we do you know given

50

00:01:59,749 --> 00:01:58,479

our background knowledge

51
00:02:10,790 --> 00:01:59,759
stay with us

52
00:02:14,150 --> 00:02:12,550
welcome to skeptica where we explore

53
00:02:16,869 --> 00:02:14,160
controversial science with leading

54
00:02:18,790 --> 00:02:16,879
researchers thinkers and their critics

55
00:02:21,990 --> 00:02:18,800
i'm your host alex zaccharis and on this

56
00:02:25,910 --> 00:02:22,000
episode dr steven law oxford trained

57
00:02:29,270 --> 00:02:25,920
philosopher noted atheist and center for

58
00:02:31,990 --> 00:02:29,280
inquiry uk member now the reason i bring

59
00:02:34,390 --> 00:02:32,000
up the center for inquiry which is a

60
00:02:36,630 --> 00:02:34,400
very skeptical atheist kind of

61
00:02:37,630 --> 00:02:36,640
organization that seeks to

62
00:02:39,990 --> 00:02:37,640
debunk

63
00:02:42,790 --> 00:02:40,000

parapsychology often that seems to be

64

00:02:44,630 --> 00:02:42,800

where it gets a lot of its notoriety is

65

00:02:47,030 --> 00:02:44,640

that that's kind of the reason that i

66

00:02:49,430 --> 00:02:47,040

wanted to talk to dr law one of the

67

00:02:50,790 --> 00:02:49,440

questions that's been going on in my

68

00:02:52,350 --> 00:02:50,800

mind is

69

00:02:56,229 --> 00:02:52,360

what are the

70

00:02:59,589 --> 00:02:56,239

philosophical underpinnings to this

71

00:03:01,990 --> 00:02:59,599

atheism skepticism that we approach from

72

00:03:03,589 --> 00:03:02,000

so many angles and in particular i'm

73

00:03:05,910 --> 00:03:03,599

interested in

74

00:03:09,190 --> 00:03:05,920

what happens when we remove

75

00:03:11,110 --> 00:03:09,200

the religious argument the the heated

76

00:03:13,509 --> 00:03:11,120

debate that seems to dominate the

77

00:03:16,470 --> 00:03:13,519

conversation of of science versus

78

00:03:18,550 --> 00:03:16,480

religion as if that's really a debate to

79

00:03:20,790 --> 00:03:18,560

me as you know in this show i think

80

00:03:23,190 --> 00:03:20,800

we've moved way past that and have

81

00:03:25,430 --> 00:03:23,200

looked for the scientific evidence that

82

00:03:28,070 --> 00:03:25,440

is highly suggestive that consciousness

83

00:03:29,110 --> 00:03:28,080

survives death so the question in my

84

00:03:31,430 --> 00:03:29,120

mind is

85

00:03:33,190 --> 00:03:31,440

what do we do with consciousness

86

00:03:34,149 --> 00:03:33,200

survives death

87

00:03:36,630 --> 00:03:34,159

meets

88

00:03:38,869 --> 00:03:36,640

atheistic philosophy

89

00:03:41,830 --> 00:03:38,879

and that's what i sought to do in this

90

00:03:43,030 --> 00:03:41,840

interview with dr steven law i hope you

91

00:03:45,430 --> 00:03:43,040

enjoy it

92

00:03:48,229 --> 00:03:45,440

today we welcome dr steven law to

93

00:03:50,630 --> 00:03:48,239

skeptico dr law is a senior lecturer in

94

00:03:52,630 --> 00:03:50,640

philosophy at the university of london

95

00:03:54,789 --> 00:03:52,640

and editor of think

96

00:03:57,190 --> 00:03:54,799

the philosophy journal for the journal

97

00:03:58,949 --> 00:03:57,200

of the royal institute of philosophy

98

00:04:01,350 --> 00:03:58,959

he's here to talk about among other

99

00:04:04,630 --> 00:04:01,360

things his latest book believing

100

00:04:07,429 --> 00:04:04,640

[h__h] how not to get sucked into an

101
00:04:09,270 --> 00:04:07,439
intellectual black hole dr law is a

102
00:04:11,270 --> 00:04:09,280
great pleasure to have you on thanks so

103
00:04:13,509 --> 00:04:11,280
much for joining me

104
00:04:15,270 --> 00:04:13,519
hi it's my pleasure to be here but

105
00:04:16,390 --> 00:04:15,280
maybe i should say i'm at heathrow

106
00:04:18,629 --> 00:04:16,400
college

107
00:04:20,550 --> 00:04:18,639
uh the university of london well you

108
00:04:23,110 --> 00:04:20,560
know i i was going to say that but that

109
00:04:24,790 --> 00:04:23,120
has a lot less meaning to us over here

110
00:04:26,790 --> 00:04:24,800
in the states we always just kind of

111
00:04:28,790 --> 00:04:26,800
associate it the university of london

112
00:04:31,270 --> 00:04:28,800
goes wow that's pretty great if i said

113
00:04:32,950 --> 00:04:31,280

uh the college then he thought

114

00:04:35,110 --> 00:04:32,960

yeah he thought college is pretty great

115

00:04:36,870 --> 00:04:35,120

it deserves to be more widely known see

116

00:04:38,550 --> 00:04:36,880

there let's give it a plug there because

117

00:04:39,830 --> 00:04:38,560

it'll probably be more significant to

118

00:04:43,110 --> 00:04:39,840

folks over there

119

00:04:44,550 --> 00:04:43,120

so uh you are known uh probably to a lot

120

00:04:47,510 --> 00:04:44,560

of people through your

121

00:04:49,510 --> 00:04:47,520

forceful yet well-mannered arguments

122

00:04:51,670 --> 00:04:49,520

against some of the religious silliness

123

00:04:53,749 --> 00:04:51,680

that seems to pervade that seems to

124

00:04:56,790 --> 00:04:53,759

pervade our culture and i guess you

125

00:04:59,510 --> 00:04:56,800

could say to many are the kinder gentler

126

00:05:01,909 --> 00:04:59,520

atheist is that something that you kind

127

00:05:05,270 --> 00:05:01,919

of set out to do or just kind of

128

00:05:07,350 --> 00:05:05,280

naturally came from your personality

129

00:05:10,790 --> 00:05:07,360

well the atheism will be the kind of

130

00:05:13,270 --> 00:05:10,800

gently kinder gentler i guess yeah yeah

131

00:05:14,550 --> 00:05:13,280

i think yeah i guess

132

00:05:16,629 --> 00:05:14,560

uh

133

00:05:19,110 --> 00:05:16,639

i drifted i've always i've been an

134

00:05:21,990 --> 00:05:19,120

atheism an atheist for a long

135

00:05:24,070 --> 00:05:22,000

time i haven't always been an atheist

136

00:05:26,390 --> 00:05:24,080

but after i became interested in

137

00:05:27,909 --> 00:05:26,400

philosophy and started studying it

138

00:05:30,469 --> 00:05:27,919

academically

139

00:05:31,510 --> 00:05:30,479

it wasn't long before i became

140

00:05:34,070 --> 00:05:31,520

um

141

00:05:36,710 --> 00:05:34,080

an atheist but i wasn't i wasn't really

142

00:05:38,390 --> 00:05:36,720

an evangelical atheist i i wasn't

143

00:05:41,830 --> 00:05:38,400

concerned with going out there and

144

00:05:42,950 --> 00:05:41,840

spreading the word as it were

145

00:05:44,629 --> 00:05:42,960

um

146

00:05:46,550 --> 00:05:44,639

i've become

147

00:05:48,230 --> 00:05:46,560

better known for that more recently just

148

00:05:49,990 --> 00:05:48,240

because

149

00:05:52,310 --> 00:05:50,000

i've had more interaction with religious

150

00:05:55,110 --> 00:05:52,320

people and i enjoy interacting with

151
00:05:58,070 --> 00:05:55,120
religious people my my college um his

152
00:06:00,469 --> 00:05:58,080
religious foundation interestingly so

153
00:06:03,189 --> 00:06:00,479
i'm very much plugged into

154
00:06:05,430 --> 00:06:03,199
that world and so inevitably

155
00:06:07,430 --> 00:06:05,440
my research has become more focused on

156
00:06:09,430 --> 00:06:07,440
religion it wasn't at all focused on

157
00:06:11,270 --> 00:06:09,440
religion just a few years ago but i've

158
00:06:12,390 --> 00:06:11,280
become more and more interested in

159
00:06:15,029 --> 00:06:12,400
religion

160
00:06:17,830 --> 00:06:15,039
and so far as the kind of gentler

161
00:06:19,830 --> 00:06:17,840
face is concerned um

162
00:06:21,830 --> 00:06:19,840
well i'd like to think i'd like to think

163
00:06:23,830 --> 00:06:21,840

that was true um

164

00:06:25,270 --> 00:06:23,840

it's not i probably have to work at it a

165

00:06:28,230 --> 00:06:25,280

little bit i mean every now and then i

166

00:06:30,870 --> 00:06:28,240

can feel my blood beginning to boil

167

00:06:33,110 --> 00:06:30,880

and i just have to take a deep breath

168

00:06:34,950 --> 00:06:33,120

uh and just think for a moment but uh

169

00:06:36,309 --> 00:06:34,960

yeah so most of the time i manage i

170

00:06:39,590 --> 00:06:36,319

managed to

171

00:06:40,950 --> 00:06:39,600

create this facade at least that i'm

172

00:06:41,670 --> 00:06:40,960

right right right

173

00:06:43,189 --> 00:06:41,680

well

174

00:06:44,870 --> 00:06:43,199

of course i think it's more than a

175

00:06:47,350 --> 00:06:44,880

facade of course but

176
00:06:49,189 --> 00:06:47,360
your arguments invariably come back to

177
00:06:50,469 --> 00:06:49,199
philosophy that's who you are you're a

178
00:06:53,670 --> 00:06:50,479
philosopher

179
00:06:56,870 --> 00:06:53,680
and i'm just wondering you know in a in

180
00:07:00,550 --> 00:06:56,880
a society where none other than stephen

181
00:07:03,029 --> 00:07:00,560
hawking has pronounced philosophy dead

182
00:07:05,909 --> 00:07:03,039
maybe you ought to just speak to

183
00:07:07,909 --> 00:07:05,919
the need we have for philosophy and

184
00:07:09,189 --> 00:07:07,919
announce maybe that philosophy isn't

185
00:07:14,550 --> 00:07:09,199
dead

186
00:07:17,350 --> 00:07:14,560
yeah it just smells funny it's um

187
00:07:18,309 --> 00:07:17,360
it's zach said about jazz

188
00:07:20,150 --> 00:07:18,319

um

189

00:07:22,629 --> 00:07:20,160

i i think that

190

00:07:24,150 --> 00:07:22,639

philosophy is important um

191

00:07:25,510 --> 00:07:24,160

it seems to me that

192

00:07:27,110 --> 00:07:25,520

well if you ask a philosopher what is

193

00:07:29,029 --> 00:07:27,120

philosophy

194

00:07:31,990 --> 00:07:29,039

you're gonna get a lot of different

195

00:07:33,350 --> 00:07:32,000

answers of course um there's no real

196

00:07:35,110 --> 00:07:33,360

consensus

197

00:07:39,189 --> 00:07:35,120

even about what it is that we're doing

198

00:07:41,029 --> 00:07:39,199

amongst philosophers but my view is that

199

00:07:43,430 --> 00:07:41,039

well here's a fairly simple

200

00:07:46,550 --> 00:07:43,440

characterization i think a philosophy is

201
00:07:47,830 --> 00:07:46,560
grappling with those big questions and

202
00:07:50,150 --> 00:07:47,840
puzzles

203
00:07:51,990 --> 00:07:50,160
that appear at least appear to reach

204
00:07:54,869 --> 00:07:52,000
beyond the point where

205
00:07:57,029 --> 00:07:54,879
the empirical sciences or mathematics

206
00:07:59,990 --> 00:07:57,039
say would be

207
00:08:01,749 --> 00:08:00,000
able to provide us even in principle um

208
00:08:04,390 --> 00:08:01,759
with some kind of answer

209
00:08:07,749 --> 00:08:04,400
um so examples of questions or puzzles

210
00:08:13,430 --> 00:08:11,189
time travel okay now time travel

211
00:08:15,029 --> 00:08:13,440
are

212
00:08:17,270 --> 00:08:15,039
you can you can raise the question of

213
00:08:19,430 --> 00:08:17,280

whether it even makes sense whether

214

00:08:22,309 --> 00:08:19,440

there's some kind of logical

215

00:08:24,790 --> 00:08:22,319

contradiction involved in the very idea

216

00:08:25,589 --> 00:08:24,800

the very positive the very idea of time

217

00:08:27,909 --> 00:08:25,599

travel

218

00:08:29,909 --> 00:08:27,919

it's ruled out logically or conceptually

219

00:08:31,990 --> 00:08:29,919

perhaps now if you can do that if you

220

00:08:33,990 --> 00:08:32,000

can just by thinking through and

221

00:08:36,230 --> 00:08:34,000

unpacking the relevant concepts

222

00:08:37,430 --> 00:08:36,240

establish that it really doesn't make

223

00:08:39,990 --> 00:08:37,440

sense

224

00:08:41,670 --> 00:08:40,000

then we've answered a a fairly big and

225

00:08:43,509 --> 00:08:41,680

important question a question that

226

00:08:45,430 --> 00:08:43,519

scientists are interested in too but now

227

00:08:47,990 --> 00:08:45,440

we've done it from the comfort

228

00:08:50,470 --> 00:08:48,000

of our armchairs just by engaging in a

229

00:08:52,710 --> 00:08:50,480

bit of a priori

230

00:08:54,630 --> 00:08:52,720

conceptual reflection so that's some

231

00:08:56,550 --> 00:08:54,640

real progress that you could make by

232

00:08:57,670 --> 00:08:56,560

doing you know thought experiments

233

00:09:00,389 --> 00:08:57,680

rather than

234

00:09:02,870 --> 00:09:00,399

laboratory experiments um and then other

235

00:09:04,710 --> 00:09:02,880

examples would be

236

00:09:07,670 --> 00:09:04,720

why is there anything

237

00:09:10,870 --> 00:09:07,680

at all uh on the face of it that that's

238

00:09:13,110 --> 00:09:10,880

a question that science will necessarily

239

00:09:14,790 --> 00:09:13,120

be unable to answer because

240

00:09:17,350 --> 00:09:14,800

when scientists explain things they

241

00:09:18,470 --> 00:09:17,360

explain things by appealing to laws or

242

00:09:21,110 --> 00:09:18,480

causes

243

00:09:23,190 --> 00:09:21,120

which they have discovered um

244

00:09:26,710 --> 00:09:23,200

but then how could science explain the

245

00:09:29,030 --> 00:09:26,720

most fundamental laws uh it couldn't um

246

00:09:31,110 --> 00:09:29,040

those will necessarily be

247

00:09:33,110 --> 00:09:31,120

lie beyond the ability of science to to

248

00:09:34,949 --> 00:09:33,120

explain if that's what a scientific

249

00:09:37,110 --> 00:09:34,959

explanation is so

250

00:09:39,110 --> 00:09:37,120

then we're we're in the territory of

251
00:09:39,990 --> 00:09:39,120
philosophy not just philosophy of course

252
00:09:42,389 --> 00:09:40,000
uh

253
00:09:44,310 --> 00:09:42,399
religion too tends to get involved with

254
00:09:45,990 --> 00:09:44,320
these big questions you know the other

255
00:09:48,310 --> 00:09:46,000
thing i think where philosophy really

256
00:09:50,310 --> 00:09:48,320
plays a role is in this whole business

257
00:09:51,910 --> 00:09:50,320
of paradigm shifting invariably we're

258
00:09:54,630 --> 00:09:51,920
always talking about shifting from one

259
00:09:56,949 --> 00:09:54,640
paradigm to another and i i think you

260
00:09:59,110 --> 00:09:56,959
know it's so funny that stephen hawking

261
00:10:00,870 --> 00:09:59,120
would say such a thing because

262
00:10:03,190 --> 00:10:00,880
physics has of course

263
00:10:05,350 --> 00:10:03,200

been in the middle of a paradigm shift

264

00:10:08,070 --> 00:10:05,360

for the last hundred years and i think

265

00:10:10,150 --> 00:10:08,080

who better than a philosopher using the

266

00:10:11,910 --> 00:10:10,160

tools of logic and reason to stand up

267

00:10:14,310 --> 00:10:11,920

and say hey wait a minute are we stuck

268

00:10:16,069 --> 00:10:14,320

in a rut here are we are we making some

269

00:10:18,470 --> 00:10:16,079

assumptions that we shouldn't be making

270

00:10:21,910 --> 00:10:18,480

i think it's a great tool and it it kind

271

00:10:24,550 --> 00:10:21,920

of strikes me as a valuable addition to

272

00:10:25,990 --> 00:10:24,560

this kind of thought process so paradigm

273

00:10:28,069 --> 00:10:26,000

shifting right

274

00:10:30,230 --> 00:10:28,079

yeah i think that's right um

275

00:10:33,829 --> 00:10:30,240

was it einstein who

276

00:10:34,710 --> 00:10:33,839

partially credited his reading of hume

277

00:10:36,710 --> 00:10:34,720

um

278

00:10:39,350 --> 00:10:36,720

with his his later subsequent

279

00:10:41,110 --> 00:10:39,360

discoveries it was this that kind of

280

00:10:43,110 --> 00:10:41,120

got him fired up got him motivated got

281

00:10:45,670 --> 00:10:43,120

him asking the kind of questions that

282

00:10:47,430 --> 00:10:45,680

then led him on to making

283

00:10:49,670 --> 00:10:47,440

these these new and important

284

00:10:51,269 --> 00:10:49,680

developments philosophy is very good at

285

00:10:53,269 --> 00:10:51,279

that getting people to take a step back

286

00:10:54,710 --> 00:10:53,279

and quit getting people to question the

287

00:10:57,190 --> 00:10:54,720

things that they have

288

00:10:59,030 --> 00:10:57,200

hitherto taken for granted even even

289

00:11:02,470 --> 00:10:59,040

within a scientific setting and that is

290

00:11:04,389 --> 00:11:02,480

often very fruitful indeed

291

00:11:07,030 --> 00:11:04,399

dr law i understand that you've taken a

292

00:11:09,670 --> 00:11:07,040

rather interesting and unconventional

293

00:11:12,630 --> 00:11:09,680

path to becoming an oxford trained

294

00:11:14,550 --> 00:11:12,640

professor of philosophy from a postman

295

00:11:16,150 --> 00:11:14,560

to a leading intellectual do i have that

296

00:11:18,069 --> 00:11:16,160

right uh tell us a little bit about your

297

00:11:20,710 --> 00:11:18,079

background yeah you have the placement

298

00:11:22,790 --> 00:11:20,720

there right certainly uh

299

00:11:25,350 --> 00:11:22,800

yeah i used to be a postman i was uh i

300

00:11:27,430 --> 00:11:25,360

was the placement for the forgerton uh

301
00:11:28,389 --> 00:11:27,440
part of cambridge for around about four

302
00:11:29,990 --> 00:11:28,399
years

303
00:11:31,910 --> 00:11:30,000
every other week i would deliver the

304
00:11:32,949 --> 00:11:31,920
mail very badly

305
00:11:35,430 --> 00:11:32,959
to

306
00:11:37,350 --> 00:11:35,440
houses i had very long hair back then it

307
00:11:40,870 --> 00:11:37,360
was right down my back

308
00:11:43,670 --> 00:11:40,880
uh so i was a hippie the hippie postman

309
00:11:46,310 --> 00:11:43,680
they'll probably remember me

310
00:11:48,470 --> 00:11:46,320
so yeah i started out there became

311
00:11:50,150 --> 00:11:48,480
interested in philosophy

312
00:11:51,590 --> 00:11:50,160
um i became interested in philosophical

313
00:11:53,269 --> 00:11:51,600

questions i wasn't really aware that

314

00:11:54,630 --> 00:11:53,279

there was this subject philosophy to

315

00:11:56,230 --> 00:11:54,640

begin with i just knew that i was

316

00:11:58,389 --> 00:11:56,240

interested in time travel and whether

317

00:11:59,990 --> 00:11:58,399

this might be a virtual world rather

318

00:12:01,670 --> 00:12:00,000

than a real one and whether or not god

319

00:12:03,990 --> 00:12:01,680

exists and what makes things right and

320

00:12:05,190 --> 00:12:04,000

wrong and so on those kind of questions

321

00:12:06,629 --> 00:12:05,200

and then i realized that yesterday you

322

00:12:07,590 --> 00:12:06,639

could pursue this

323

00:12:10,230 --> 00:12:07,600

stuff

324

00:12:12,069 --> 00:12:10,240

um at university and once i realized

325

00:12:14,470 --> 00:12:12,079

that then there was no stopping me i

326

00:12:17,350 --> 00:12:14,480

applied as a mature student

327

00:12:19,750 --> 00:12:17,360

and somehow by some miracle i gained

328

00:12:21,590 --> 00:12:19,760

intro to a university and i've never

329

00:12:24,629 --> 00:12:21,600

never left i think that's very humble i

330

00:12:27,590 --> 00:12:24,639

don't know many postmen who could decide

331

00:12:29,750 --> 00:12:27,600

that they're going to get a phd from

332

00:12:31,509 --> 00:12:29,760

oxford and then just go about doing it

333

00:12:33,430 --> 00:12:31,519

but we'll leave that aside let's let's

334

00:12:35,990 --> 00:12:33,440

talk for a minute about your most recent

335

00:12:37,750 --> 00:12:36,000

book believing [h__h]

336

00:12:39,910 --> 00:12:37,760

provocative title

337

00:12:41,110 --> 00:12:39,920

who's it written for it's written i

338

00:12:43,990 --> 00:12:41,120

guess

339

00:12:47,750 --> 00:12:44,000

one group of people that i rate it for

340

00:12:49,910 --> 00:12:47,760

well i've got fairly young kids um

341

00:12:51,190 --> 00:12:49,920

i was kind of a late starter with having

342

00:12:54,470 --> 00:12:51,200

children so i've affect fairly young

343

00:12:57,030 --> 00:12:54,480

kids and it concerns me

344

00:12:58,870 --> 00:12:57,040

that there are all these belief systems

345

00:12:59,829 --> 00:12:58,880

out there in the world

346

00:13:03,910 --> 00:12:59,839

um

347

00:13:05,829 --> 00:13:03,920

many benign but some not quite so benign

348

00:13:08,949 --> 00:13:05,839

and certainly belief systems which are

349

00:13:11,269 --> 00:13:08,959

capable of acting like a black hole

350

00:13:13,190 --> 00:13:11,279

an intellectual black hole you you get

351
00:13:15,829 --> 00:13:13,200
too close and you start getting sucked

352
00:13:17,509 --> 00:13:15,839
in and before you know it you're trapped

353
00:13:20,069 --> 00:13:17,519
in there and you can't you becoming an

354
00:13:21,990 --> 00:13:20,079
intellectual prisoner and so sometimes

355
00:13:23,670 --> 00:13:22,000
sometimes they're quite benign but

356
00:13:26,550 --> 00:13:23,680
sometimes they're really quite

357
00:13:27,990 --> 00:13:26,560
exploitative financially exploitative

358
00:13:29,910 --> 00:13:28,000
for example

359
00:13:32,069 --> 00:13:29,920
they take people away from their friends

360
00:13:34,150 --> 00:13:32,079
and families they make people give up

361
00:13:35,030 --> 00:13:34,160
opportunities that they really should

362
00:13:35,829 --> 00:13:35,040
take

363
00:13:39,350 --> 00:13:35,839

um

364

00:13:41,430 --> 00:13:39,360

and i it concerns me that our cultural

365

00:13:43,829 --> 00:13:41,440

environment contains those kind of

366

00:13:46,949 --> 00:13:43,839

dangerous belief systems and i think we

367

00:13:49,030 --> 00:13:46,959

should all know the warning signs if you

368

00:13:50,629 --> 00:13:49,040

like of

369

00:13:52,470 --> 00:13:50,639

an intellectual black hole so the book

370

00:13:53,990 --> 00:13:52,480

was really written for

371

00:13:56,389 --> 00:13:54,000

for everyone but particularly for young

372

00:13:59,269 --> 00:13:56,399

people who might come into contact with

373

00:14:01,430 --> 00:13:59,279

the belief system like that um just to

374

00:14:04,230 --> 00:14:01,440

give them some awareness

375

00:14:05,910 --> 00:14:04,240

of what the warning signs would be uh

376

00:14:07,910 --> 00:14:05,920

what the danger signals are so the

377

00:14:09,750 --> 00:14:07,920

little red light comes on in their head

378

00:14:11,430 --> 00:14:09,760

the next time some wide-eyed true

379

00:14:12,949 --> 00:14:11,440

believer thrusts a leaflet into their

380

00:14:14,949 --> 00:14:12,959

hand as they walk down the high street

381

00:14:16,870 --> 00:14:14,959

and says have you heard the truth the

382

00:14:19,350 --> 00:14:16,880

good news or whatever it happens

383

00:14:21,430 --> 00:14:19,360

here's a quote from the book

384

00:14:23,990 --> 00:14:21,440

when i talk about a [h__\h] belief

385

00:14:26,550 --> 00:14:24,000

system it's not the content i'm

386

00:14:29,110 --> 00:14:26,560

suggesting is [h__\h] but rather the

387

00:14:31,430 --> 00:14:29,120

manner in which its core beliefs are

388

00:14:35,110 --> 00:14:31,440

defended and promoted

389

00:14:36,949 --> 00:14:35,120

tell us a little bit about that sure um

390

00:14:39,509 --> 00:14:36,959

so i talk about all sorts of belief

391

00:14:41,350 --> 00:14:39,519

systems in the book um and

392

00:14:44,870 --> 00:14:41,360

in some cases

393

00:14:47,110 --> 00:14:44,880

the core beliefs could be true um so i'm

394

00:14:49,910 --> 00:14:47,120

not attacking the claim that the beliefs

395

00:14:52,790 --> 00:14:49,920

are true in in many cases what i'm

396

00:14:54,069 --> 00:14:52,800

pointing out is the way in which

397

00:14:56,470 --> 00:14:54,079

people will

398

00:14:59,750 --> 00:14:56,480

defend their beliefs begin to build a

399

00:15:02,069 --> 00:14:59,760

wall around them that immunizes their

400

00:15:04,790 --> 00:15:02,079

belief system and protects it from any

401
00:15:07,189 --> 00:15:04,800
kind of intellectual threat

402
00:15:09,990 --> 00:15:07,199
and creates a kind of a veneer

403
00:15:11,269 --> 00:15:10,000
of reasonableness of sort of foe or fake

404
00:15:13,670 --> 00:15:11,279
reasonableness

405
00:15:16,949 --> 00:15:13,680
um it's it's the mechanisms that are

406
00:15:19,750 --> 00:15:16,959
used that are applied to generate that

407
00:15:21,750 --> 00:15:19,760
kind of structure around the beliefs

408
00:15:23,829 --> 00:15:21,760
that then turns it into

409
00:15:26,069 --> 00:15:23,839
a sort of mental prison

410
00:15:27,750 --> 00:15:26,079
for the true believer it's it's those

411
00:15:29,110 --> 00:15:27,760
mechanisms that i'm that i'm most

412
00:15:31,670 --> 00:15:29,120
interested

413
00:15:33,189 --> 00:15:31,680

in i i identify a number of those in the

414

00:15:35,670 --> 00:15:33,199

book of course when we talk about

415

00:15:38,150 --> 00:15:35,680

[h__\h] belief systems the discussion

416

00:15:40,470 --> 00:15:38,160

often comes back to debates about

417

00:15:43,030 --> 00:15:40,480

christianity a topic you're very

418

00:15:45,030 --> 00:15:43,040

comfortable debating and have debated

419

00:15:47,189 --> 00:15:45,040

some of the leading christian apologists

420

00:15:49,910 --> 00:15:47,199

and folks can find that on youtube or in

421

00:15:51,350 --> 00:15:49,920

any number of places i guess

422

00:15:53,110 --> 00:15:51,360

i feel like

423

00:15:55,030 --> 00:15:53,120

when i hear some of those debates i want

424

00:15:57,189 --> 00:15:55,040

to go wow is that really

425

00:15:59,269 --> 00:15:57,199

where we're at are we still

426
00:16:01,110 --> 00:15:59,279
talking about the empty tomb and

427
00:16:03,829 --> 00:16:01,120
debating that

428
00:16:05,350 --> 00:16:03,839
and on one hand i guess maybe that is

429
00:16:06,790 --> 00:16:05,360
where we're at

430
00:16:09,189 --> 00:16:06,800
on the other hand

431
00:16:11,110 --> 00:16:09,199
i guess i want to move the discussion

432
00:16:13,829 --> 00:16:11,120
forward and say okay you know that

433
00:16:15,990 --> 00:16:13,839
culture war debate is really over

434
00:16:18,710 --> 00:16:16,000
you've won here you go

435
00:16:20,550 --> 00:16:18,720
but let's move on to a more interesting

436
00:16:23,030 --> 00:16:20,560
culture war battle

437
00:16:24,949 --> 00:16:23,040
and that one i think is somewhat even

438
00:16:26,550 --> 00:16:24,959

obscured by this other debate we're

439

00:16:28,230 --> 00:16:26,560

having about you know

440

00:16:30,550 --> 00:16:28,240

empty tomb and all that stuff and that

441

00:16:33,430 --> 00:16:30,560

has to do with scientific

442

00:16:34,790 --> 00:16:33,440

materialism and whether or not

443

00:16:37,110 --> 00:16:34,800

we are

444

00:16:39,590 --> 00:16:37,120

anything these big picture questions

445

00:16:41,189 --> 00:16:39,600

meaning of life kind of questions

446

00:16:44,710 --> 00:16:41,199

what do you think about that are we

447

00:16:46,470 --> 00:16:44,720

stuck in a rut a little bit with the

448

00:16:49,990 --> 00:16:46,480

christian versus

449

00:16:52,230 --> 00:16:50,000

atheist debate and what about this idea

450

00:16:54,790 --> 00:16:52,240

of moving the debate to

451
00:16:56,870 --> 00:16:54,800
this notion of scientific materialism

452
00:16:59,509 --> 00:16:56,880
any thoughts on that well maybe i should

453
00:17:01,430 --> 00:16:59,519
just point out that um

454
00:17:02,829 --> 00:17:01,440
i'm not wedded to

455
00:17:05,429 --> 00:17:02,839
our

456
00:17:08,150 --> 00:17:05,439
naturalism or materialism

457
00:17:10,789 --> 00:17:08,160
as a philosopher in fact

458
00:17:13,750 --> 00:17:10,799
not that many philosophers

459
00:17:15,510 --> 00:17:13,760
are professional philosophers

460
00:17:17,669 --> 00:17:15,520
tend to be

461
00:17:21,510 --> 00:17:17,679
fairly divided on the naturalism issue

462
00:17:23,350 --> 00:17:21,520
there was a filled papers survey done

463
00:17:24,710 --> 00:17:23,360

a few years ago

464

00:17:26,870 --> 00:17:24,720

of professional philosophers and

465

00:17:29,909 --> 00:17:26,880

graduate students around the world only

466

00:17:31,350 --> 00:17:29,919

only around about 50 percent sign up to

467

00:17:34,150 --> 00:17:31,360

naturalism

468

00:17:36,789 --> 00:17:34,160

um i find you only about less than 15

469

00:17:38,950 --> 00:17:36,799

sign up to any kind of theism at all

470

00:17:40,710 --> 00:17:38,960

so they don't they don't believe in god

471

00:17:42,470 --> 00:17:40,720

very many of them the vast majority of

472

00:17:44,789 --> 00:17:42,480

them but still

473

00:17:46,950 --> 00:17:44,799

neither do they sign up to naturalism

474

00:17:48,230 --> 00:17:46,960

necessarily

475

00:17:51,350 --> 00:17:48,240

you often

476

00:17:52,870 --> 00:17:51,360

find debates about religion set up as

477

00:17:55,110 --> 00:17:52,880

debates between on the one hand

478

00:17:58,070 --> 00:17:55,120

religious people on the other hand

479

00:17:59,990 --> 00:17:58,080

the the naturalists and the materialists

480

00:18:02,710 --> 00:18:00,000

and the truth is that there are there

481

00:18:04,150 --> 00:18:02,720

are other options you you know it's not

482

00:18:06,150 --> 00:18:04,160

either or you don't have to be one or

483

00:18:07,350 --> 00:18:06,160

the other of those two things well well

484

00:18:09,029 --> 00:18:07,360

but really

485

00:18:10,390 --> 00:18:09,039

you know i i understand where you're

486

00:18:12,230 --> 00:18:10,400

where you're coming from on that and and

487

00:18:13,669 --> 00:18:12,240

this now becomes one of the problems i

488

00:18:15,430 --> 00:18:13,679

think that a lot of folks including

489

00:18:16,789 --> 00:18:15,440

myself have with philosophy and you

490

00:18:18,630 --> 00:18:16,799

don't fall into this as much which i

491

00:18:21,029 --> 00:18:18,640

really appreciate is that i think we

492

00:18:21,830 --> 00:18:21,039

have to stay grounded a little bit in

493

00:18:29,029 --> 00:18:21,840

the

494

00:18:31,029 --> 00:18:29,039

find ourselves in so this question of

495

00:18:33,510 --> 00:18:31,039

christianity or this question of god or

496

00:18:36,870 --> 00:18:33,520

no god really the atheism question

497

00:18:38,470 --> 00:18:36,880

really i think has been set up as a

498

00:18:41,190 --> 00:18:38,480

question about

499

00:18:43,350 --> 00:18:41,200

meaning materialism richard dawkins we

500

00:18:45,909 --> 00:18:43,360

are biological robots

501
00:18:47,430 --> 00:18:45,919
life has no meaning your consciousness

502
00:18:50,549 --> 00:18:47,440
is an illusion

503
00:18:53,909 --> 00:18:50,559
that is really the core intellectual

504
00:18:55,510 --> 00:18:53,919
thrust of atheism so it might not be

505
00:18:58,230 --> 00:18:55,520
your atheism but i think you'd have to

506
00:19:01,190 --> 00:18:58,240
concede that you know that is the core

507
00:19:03,510 --> 00:19:01,200
thrust of the atheism debate if you will

508
00:19:05,350 --> 00:19:03,520
and i i would suggest to you go ahead

509
00:19:07,990 --> 00:19:05,360
i'm sorry yeah i'm not sure that's true

510
00:19:09,830 --> 00:19:08,000
i mean there clearly are some very vocal

511
00:19:12,470 --> 00:19:09,840
atheists who also you know very much

512
00:19:14,150 --> 00:19:12,480
wedded to materialism and naturalism

513
00:19:17,029 --> 00:19:14,160

but there are there are quite a few like

514

00:19:18,950 --> 00:19:17,039

me that that are not um

515

00:19:20,230 --> 00:19:18,960

so you know there are a range of views

516

00:19:22,230 --> 00:19:20,240

and

517

00:19:25,270 --> 00:19:22,240

it it one of the things that bothers me

518

00:19:27,590 --> 00:19:25,280

is the way in which our religious people

519

00:19:30,390 --> 00:19:27,600

think that they can establish atheism as

520

00:19:33,190 --> 00:19:30,400

false by simply finding fault with

521

00:19:35,830 --> 00:19:33,200

naturalism or materialism so if they

522

00:19:37,909 --> 00:19:35,840

could just show for example that there's

523

00:19:38,789 --> 00:19:37,919

the consciousness cannot be accommodated

524

00:19:41,350 --> 00:19:38,799

within

525

00:19:43,350 --> 00:19:41,360

um a sort of naturalistic worldview well

526

00:19:44,950 --> 00:19:43,360

then that's atheism sorted you can't be

527

00:19:47,750 --> 00:19:44,960

an atheist now that doesn't follow at

528

00:19:49,909 --> 00:19:47,760

all um that's just a poor argument

529

00:19:52,070 --> 00:19:49,919

against atheism i mean i'm an atheist i

530

00:19:54,150 --> 00:19:52,080

don't believe in god or gods but that

531

00:19:56,870 --> 00:19:54,160

doesn't mean that i had to sign up to

532

00:19:59,510 --> 00:19:56,880

naturalism or materialism not at all i

533

00:20:00,789 --> 00:19:59,520

could be a mathematical platonist for

534

00:20:02,549 --> 00:20:00,799

example

535

00:20:04,230 --> 00:20:02,559

as many mathematicians are aren't they

536

00:20:07,029 --> 00:20:04,240

they they believe that mathematics

537

00:20:08,470 --> 00:20:07,039

describes some non-natural realm well i

538

00:20:09,430 --> 00:20:08,480

could take that view without believing

539

00:20:11,350 --> 00:20:09,440

in god

540

00:20:13,510 --> 00:20:11,360

so i could be an atheist without being a

541

00:20:15,750 --> 00:20:13,520

naturalist or materialist i'm gonna try

542

00:20:17,830 --> 00:20:15,760

and dance around that because speaking

543

00:20:19,510 --> 00:20:17,840

of intellectual black holes that's an

544

00:20:21,270 --> 00:20:19,520

argument we could get into about god and

545

00:20:23,669 --> 00:20:21,280

then defining god and your definition

546

00:20:24,630 --> 00:20:23,679

and all that i i do want to come back to

547

00:20:26,549 --> 00:20:24,640

this though because we're on to

548

00:20:27,830 --> 00:20:26,559

something and that's that i want to talk

549

00:20:30,070 --> 00:20:27,840

about meaning

550

00:20:32,070 --> 00:20:30,080

meaning in life meaning in

551
00:20:35,029 --> 00:20:32,080
the universe because i think that's one

552
00:20:37,190 --> 00:20:35,039
of the hardest challenges that atheists

553
00:20:39,350 --> 00:20:37,200
face and whether it's explicit or

554
00:20:41,830 --> 00:20:39,360
implicit i think it's where people are

555
00:20:43,029 --> 00:20:41,840
coming from and that's that hey you're

556
00:20:45,110 --> 00:20:43,039
telling me

557
00:20:47,029 --> 00:20:45,120
mr atheist and i'm not hanging this on

558
00:20:49,430 --> 00:20:47,039
you but you're telling me life has no

559
00:20:51,270 --> 00:20:49,440
meaning and yet i know my life has

560
00:20:53,350 --> 00:20:51,280
meaning i know it kind of

561
00:20:55,909 --> 00:20:53,360
intuitively i know my life has meaning

562
00:20:57,510 --> 00:20:55,919
so convince to me that my life doesn't

563
00:20:58,950 --> 00:20:57,520

have meaning and i think we can back

564

00:21:01,270 --> 00:20:58,960

that up again i can go to richard

565

00:21:03,350 --> 00:21:01,280

dawkins and we are biological robots or

566

00:21:05,350 --> 00:21:03,360

i can go to daniel dennett and you are

567

00:21:07,029 --> 00:21:05,360

an illusion i mean this isn't this one

568

00:21:10,789 --> 00:21:07,039

of the core tenets

569

00:21:13,510 --> 00:21:10,799

if not of atheism of the cultural

570

00:21:15,830 --> 00:21:13,520

message that we get about atheism and

571

00:21:17,350 --> 00:21:15,840

that is that life has no meaning well

572

00:21:20,870 --> 00:21:17,360

that's an enormous question whether life

573

00:21:22,870 --> 00:21:20,880

has meaning or not um

574

00:21:25,750 --> 00:21:22,880

i you know i if you're interested in

575

00:21:27,590 --> 00:21:25,760

what i think i would read my book on

576
00:21:28,630 --> 00:21:27,600
humanism a very short introduction to

577
00:21:31,350 --> 00:21:28,640
humanism because it's got a whole

578
00:21:33,990 --> 00:21:31,360
chapter on the meaning of life um in it

579
00:21:35,750 --> 00:21:34,000
um i couldn't begin to unpack all of the

580
00:21:38,870 --> 00:21:35,760
issues here but it seems to me that

581
00:21:41,029 --> 00:21:38,880
first of all both theists and atheists

582
00:21:43,190 --> 00:21:41,039
have a problem so far as the meaning of

583
00:21:45,350 --> 00:21:43,200
life is concerned it's all very well

584
00:21:46,789 --> 00:21:45,360
saying hey you mr atheist you explain

585
00:21:48,549 --> 00:21:46,799
the meaning of life but the truth is

586
00:21:50,470 --> 00:21:48,559
that when you listen to

587
00:21:52,149 --> 00:21:50,480
the accounts of

588
00:21:54,990 --> 00:21:52,159

a meaningful life that are given by the

589

00:21:56,950 --> 00:21:55,000

religious they often turn out to be very

590

00:21:58,470 --> 00:21:56,960

unsatisfactory too

591

00:22:00,310 --> 00:21:58,480

being told for example that you were

592

00:22:02,630 --> 00:22:00,320

made for a purpose

593

00:22:04,710 --> 00:22:02,640

uh and that gives your life meaning

594

00:22:06,950 --> 00:22:04,720

um that that's the explanation for why

595

00:22:08,870 --> 00:22:06,960

it has meaning it's not a very good

596

00:22:10,950 --> 00:22:08,880

explanation i mean suppose it turns out

597

00:22:13,750 --> 00:22:10,960

that i was indeed made for a purpose

598

00:22:15,430 --> 00:22:13,760

suppose we all were uh engineered by

599

00:22:16,950 --> 00:22:15,440

aliens to clean their toilets and

600

00:22:18,230 --> 00:22:16,960

they're coming soon to pick us up and

601
00:22:20,630 --> 00:22:18,240
take us off and

602
00:22:22,789 --> 00:22:20,640
deliver us to their toilets where we'll

603
00:22:23,750 --> 00:22:22,799
be find ourselves happily slaving away

604
00:22:25,750 --> 00:22:23,760
forever

605
00:22:27,510 --> 00:22:25,760
doing the job that we were always meant

606
00:22:29,350 --> 00:22:27,520
to do does that do you now feel that

607
00:22:31,750 --> 00:22:29,360
your life has meaning

608
00:22:33,270 --> 00:22:31,760
not at all uh having a purpose being

609
00:22:35,270 --> 00:22:33,280
made for a purpose does not give your

610
00:22:36,549 --> 00:22:35,280
life meaning certainly certainly not

611
00:22:38,789 --> 00:22:36,559
necessarily

612
00:22:41,270 --> 00:22:38,799
and so these quick easy glib religious

613
00:22:43,750 --> 00:22:41,280

answers are not really good answers at

614

00:22:45,590 --> 00:22:43,760

all um they just create

615

00:22:47,510 --> 00:22:45,600

they just create the illusion that

616

00:22:49,510 --> 00:22:47,520

meaning has somehow miraculously been

617

00:22:50,789 --> 00:22:49,520

conjured up by the really by the

618

00:22:52,149 --> 00:22:50,799

religious person but on closer

619

00:22:53,669 --> 00:22:52,159

examination the meaning just runs

620

00:22:55,350 --> 00:22:53,679

through your fingers so meaning is a

621

00:22:57,270 --> 00:22:55,360

problem for everyone i don't think it's

622

00:22:59,909 --> 00:22:57,280

that atheists particularly have a

623

00:23:02,870 --> 00:22:59,919

problem any more than theists

624

00:23:05,669 --> 00:23:02,880

i agree for the most part i do think

625

00:23:08,630 --> 00:23:05,679

that then we have to be explicit and say

626

00:23:10,789 --> 00:23:08,640

biological robots richard dawkins is a

627

00:23:13,029 --> 00:23:10,799

silly notion consciousness is an

628

00:23:15,510 --> 00:23:13,039

illusion daniel dennett is a silly

629

00:23:17,029 --> 00:23:15,520

notion and put it kind of if we just

630

00:23:17,990 --> 00:23:17,039

want to kind of sort it out and say all

631

00:23:20,789 --> 00:23:18,000

these

632

00:23:22,789 --> 00:23:20,799

goofy religious dogma concepts are silly

633

00:23:24,310 --> 00:23:22,799

and we can kind of throw them away then

634

00:23:26,390 --> 00:23:24,320

you know let's throw these guys away too

635

00:23:28,710 --> 00:23:26,400

because i don't think any of that really

636

00:23:30,230 --> 00:23:28,720

makes much sense either i i always think

637

00:23:31,990 --> 00:23:30,240

and i sent you this quota so i'd love to

638

00:23:32,950 --> 00:23:32,000

get your comment on it i always think of

639

00:23:37,669 --> 00:23:32,960

the

640

00:23:41,350 --> 00:23:37,679

famous nobel prize-winning french

641

00:23:43,870 --> 00:23:41,360

philosopher albert camus who said

642

00:23:46,149 --> 00:23:43,880

there's really only one serious

643

00:23:49,510 --> 00:23:46,159

philosophical question and that is

644

00:23:51,350 --> 00:23:49,520

suicide and i think you know it's pretty

645

00:23:53,350 --> 00:23:51,360

very french very french but i think it

646

00:23:54,789 --> 00:23:53,360

gets the heart of this meaning i mean if

647

00:23:56,470 --> 00:23:54,799

you really think

648

00:23:58,390 --> 00:23:56,480

life has no meaning

649

00:24:00,950 --> 00:23:58,400

then

650

00:24:04,149 --> 00:24:00,960

what is there i mean what really

651
00:24:06,230 --> 00:24:04,159
could possibly be a motivation for life

652
00:24:08,070 --> 00:24:06,240
i think it's almost a given that our

653
00:24:10,630 --> 00:24:08,080
life has meaning because that's how we

654
00:24:13,750 --> 00:24:10,640
live our life that is that we our life

655
00:24:15,909 --> 00:24:13,760
is defined by the decisions we make how

656
00:24:18,230 --> 00:24:15,919
we live our life is what is what we

657
00:24:20,390 --> 00:24:18,240
believe and no one lives their life as

658
00:24:21,669 --> 00:24:20,400
it as if it has no meaning no but are

659
00:24:23,590 --> 00:24:21,679
you suggesting that the life of an

660
00:24:25,110 --> 00:24:23,600
atheist is uh

661
00:24:27,830 --> 00:24:25,120
is meaningless

662
00:24:30,549 --> 00:24:27,840
well i i'm suggesting that

663
00:24:31,590 --> 00:24:30,559

that that this is the philosophical

664

00:24:33,350 --> 00:24:31,600

route

665

00:24:36,230 --> 00:24:33,360

that has to be

666

00:24:39,029 --> 00:24:36,240

fully taken in and fully addressed so

667

00:24:41,669 --> 00:24:39,039

i i think it gets obscured because i

668

00:24:44,310 --> 00:24:41,679

understand i get it you know inundated

669

00:24:46,870 --> 00:24:44,320

with religious [h__\h]

670

00:24:48,870 --> 00:24:46,880

inundated with a religious

671

00:24:51,029 --> 00:24:48,880

black hole that just kind of is

672

00:24:53,190 --> 00:24:51,039

confusing and doesn't make sense and is

673

00:24:55,430 --> 00:24:53,200

infused into our society in a way that

674

00:24:57,590 --> 00:24:55,440

just makes you question the institutions

675

00:24:59,110 --> 00:24:57,600

that we have around us i get all that

676

00:25:01,190 --> 00:24:59,120

but when you get to the other side of

677

00:25:04,310 --> 00:25:01,200

that and you say well then wait a minute

678

00:25:06,630 --> 00:25:04,320

am i buying into this other idea of my

679

00:25:08,070 --> 00:25:06,640

life has no meaning of course it's not

680

00:25:10,390 --> 00:25:08,080

because that doesn't make any sense

681

00:25:13,190 --> 00:25:10,400

either so we're kind of i i think it's

682

00:25:15,110 --> 00:25:13,200

facing the reality that we really are

683

00:25:17,350 --> 00:25:15,120

between these two worlds if we think

684

00:25:19,350 --> 00:25:17,360

things through but it's it's a classic

685

00:25:21,269 --> 00:25:19,360

philosophical conundrum isn't it you

686

00:25:23,350 --> 00:25:21,279

know what is the meaning of life what

687

00:25:26,390 --> 00:25:23,360

makes life meaningful and in fact there

688

00:25:28,630 --> 00:25:26,400

are plenty of um atheist answers to that

689

00:25:30,230 --> 00:25:28,640

question which perhaps they're not going

690

00:25:31,909 --> 00:25:30,240

to you you're not going to find them

691

00:25:34,070 --> 00:25:31,919

very attractive answers or very

692

00:25:36,149 --> 00:25:34,080

plausible answers but the fact is that

693

00:25:37,830 --> 00:25:36,159

religious answers tend not to be very

694

00:25:39,590 --> 00:25:37,840

plausible either when you start to look

695

00:25:41,110 --> 00:25:39,600

at them more closely it's just a

696

00:25:42,390 --> 00:25:41,120

philosophical

697

00:25:44,390 --> 00:25:42,400

puzzle

698

00:25:45,990 --> 00:25:44,400

in much the same way as

699

00:25:47,830 --> 00:25:46,000

i don't know why is there anything at

700

00:25:49,590 --> 00:25:47,840

all it's a philosophical puzzle there

701
00:25:51,350 --> 00:25:49,600
are all sorts of philosophical puzzles

702
00:25:53,510 --> 00:25:51,360
and we what i think we should do is we

703
00:25:55,029 --> 00:25:53,520
should acknowledge that they're tough

704
00:25:56,549 --> 00:25:55,039
and we don't necessarily know the

705
00:25:58,789 --> 00:25:56,559
answers

706
00:26:01,110 --> 00:25:58,799
to them but it doesn't follow them that

707
00:26:03,110 --> 00:26:01,120
the default position must be to kind of

708
00:26:05,909 --> 00:26:03,120
immediately appeal to god or the

709
00:26:08,070 --> 00:26:05,919
supernatural uh and suppose that that

710
00:26:09,990 --> 00:26:08,080
then must be the correct answer i can't

711
00:26:12,230 --> 00:26:10,000
say that that's that's right totally

712
00:26:13,029 --> 00:26:12,240
agree but but neither should we appeal

713
00:26:17,269 --> 00:26:13,039

to

714

00:26:23,029 --> 00:26:17,279

uh

715

00:26:25,590 --> 00:26:23,039

like i said you know a daniel dennett

716

00:26:27,350 --> 00:26:25,600

biological robot meme you know i mean

717

00:26:28,630 --> 00:26:27,360

that stuff when you really break it down

718

00:26:29,909 --> 00:26:28,640

doesn't make any sense but i've kind of

719

00:26:31,190 --> 00:26:29,919

already said that we've covered that

720

00:26:33,269 --> 00:26:31,200

ground i don't know if it doesn't make

721

00:26:34,870 --> 00:26:33,279

any sense i mean you know whether or not

722

00:26:36,470 --> 00:26:34,880

um

723

00:26:38,390 --> 00:26:36,480

you know precisely what the relationship

724

00:26:42,549 --> 00:26:38,400

is between mind and body

725

00:26:44,870 --> 00:26:42,559

uh is a is a very very interesting

726

00:26:46,470 --> 00:26:44,880

question i don't sign up to any

727

00:26:48,070 --> 00:26:46,480

particular view

728

00:26:50,710 --> 00:26:48,080

so far as that

729

00:26:54,149 --> 00:26:50,720

question is concerned but i have to say

730

00:26:55,669 --> 00:26:54,159

that there is a pretty good looking case

731

00:26:57,190 --> 00:26:55,679

for saying

732

00:26:59,029 --> 00:26:57,200

that

733

00:27:02,470 --> 00:26:59,039

if the mind is to have any kind of

734

00:27:05,990 --> 00:27:02,480

effect within the physical natural realm

735

00:27:07,909 --> 00:27:06,000

it somehow has to be part of that realm

736

00:27:09,350 --> 00:27:07,919

um

737

00:27:10,630 --> 00:27:09,360

you know i'm not necessarily endorsing

738

00:27:12,630 --> 00:27:10,640

this argument but there's nothing

739

00:27:15,110 --> 00:27:12,640

there's a pretty good looking argument

740

00:27:16,950 --> 00:27:15,120

for saying that if the mind is to have

741

00:27:18,950 --> 00:27:16,960

effects within the physical world it

742

00:27:20,470 --> 00:27:18,960

must be physical because what we know of

743

00:27:22,950 --> 00:27:20,480

the physical world

744

00:27:25,990 --> 00:27:22,960

everywhere we look we find that physical

745

00:27:27,590 --> 00:27:26,000

effects have physical causes and so if

746

00:27:29,909 --> 00:27:27,600

that is true

747

00:27:31,029 --> 00:27:29,919

then the mind must itself somehow be

748

00:27:33,110 --> 00:27:31,039

physical we're going to have to

749

00:27:35,750 --> 00:27:33,120

accommodate it within the physical in

750

00:27:38,070 --> 00:27:35,760

order to account for its ability to

751

00:27:40,230 --> 00:27:38,080

cause physical behavior for example

752

00:27:42,470 --> 00:27:40,240

whether isn't that a isn't that a fairly

753

00:27:45,430 --> 00:27:42,480

plausible looking argument perhaps but

754

00:27:47,269 --> 00:27:45,440

i'd say we better be damn sure that

755

00:27:51,110 --> 00:27:47,279

that's the way it is because we've built

756

00:27:53,909 --> 00:27:51,120

this edifice of scientism around that

757

00:27:55,750 --> 00:27:53,919

our whole culture is built on that and

758

00:27:58,149 --> 00:27:55,760

when we start seeing cracks in the

759

00:27:59,669 --> 00:27:58,159

foundation of that which i think we do

760

00:28:02,389 --> 00:27:59,679

and it sounds like you're at least

761

00:28:04,470 --> 00:28:02,399

somewhat open to examining those i think

762

00:28:07,750 --> 00:28:04,480

we really have to step back and look at

763

00:28:10,549 --> 00:28:07,760

what's at stake let me in that spirit

764

00:28:12,710 --> 00:28:10,559

return to your book believing [h__\h]

765

00:28:14,710 --> 00:28:12,720

with another quote that i liked the more

766

00:28:16,789 --> 00:28:14,720

we appeal to mystery to get ourselves

767

00:28:19,190 --> 00:28:16,799

out of intellectual trouble the more we

768

00:28:21,590 --> 00:28:19,200

use it as a carpet under which to sweep

769

00:28:24,310 --> 00:28:21,600

inconvenient truths or discoveries the

770

00:28:27,750 --> 00:28:24,320

more vulnerable we become to deceit

771

00:28:28,830 --> 00:28:27,760

deceit by both others and by ourselves

772

00:28:31,750 --> 00:28:28,840

let me

773

00:28:34,710 --> 00:28:31,760

juxtapose the quote from your book with

774

00:28:37,350 --> 00:28:34,720

a quote from biologist rupert sheldrick

775

00:28:39,430 --> 00:28:37,360

author of the science delusion one of

776

00:28:41,830 --> 00:28:39,440

these folks out there among many many

777

00:28:44,630 --> 00:28:41,840

that i've spoken with and are out there

778

00:28:46,950 --> 00:28:44,640

who kind of see this materialism

779

00:28:49,269 --> 00:28:46,960

scientific materialism and the position

780

00:28:51,750 --> 00:28:49,279

of the folks like richard dawkins as a

781

00:28:53,590 --> 00:28:51,760

major impediment to really moving

782

00:28:56,470 --> 00:28:53,600

forward and answering some of these big

783

00:28:58,630 --> 00:28:56,480

questions here's what sheldrick says

784

00:29:00,230 --> 00:28:58,640

for more than 200 years materialists

785

00:29:02,549 --> 00:29:00,240

have promised that science will

786

00:29:05,990 --> 00:29:02,559

eventually explain everything in terms

787

00:29:08,149 --> 00:29:06,000

of physics and chemistry these believers

788

00:29:10,870 --> 00:29:08,159

are sustained by the faith that

789

00:29:12,710 --> 00:29:10,880

scientific discoveries will justify

790

00:29:14,389 --> 00:29:12,720

their beliefs so of course he's been a

791

00:29:17,669 --> 00:29:14,399

little bit provocative in kind of using

792

00:29:20,630 --> 00:29:17,679

these words of religion but i i think he

793

00:29:23,510 --> 00:29:20,640

has a point when he talks about this

794

00:29:26,230 --> 00:29:23,520

promissory note of science and that

795

00:29:28,789 --> 00:29:26,240

really being a part of scientism of just

796

00:29:30,950 --> 00:29:28,799

hey wait a minute boys we got it covered

797

00:29:32,630 --> 00:29:30,960

just give us some more time when really

798

00:29:35,909 --> 00:29:32,640

when we look at the long history of

799

00:29:38,630 --> 00:29:35,919

science for the last 200 years we see

800

00:29:40,070 --> 00:29:38,640

progress in some areas and in other

801
00:29:41,830 --> 00:29:40,080
areas the kind of questions we're

802
00:29:44,870 --> 00:29:41,840
talking about in terms of

803
00:29:48,070 --> 00:29:44,880
consciousness in terms of meaning we see

804
00:29:49,430 --> 00:29:48,080
very little progress or or worse yet we

805
00:29:51,269 --> 00:29:49,440
see progress

806
00:29:53,430 --> 00:29:51,279
that's leading us in another direction

807
00:29:55,669 --> 00:29:53,440
that we're not willing to follow because

808
00:29:58,149 --> 00:29:55,679
we're married to this idea that unless

809
00:30:00,630 --> 00:29:58,159
we can measure everything then we're

810
00:30:02,870 --> 00:30:00,640
going to be lost right well i i i don't

811
00:30:05,430 --> 00:30:02,880
sign up to scientism if scientism is the

812
00:30:07,350 --> 00:30:05,440
view that ultimately every meaningful

813
00:30:09,990 --> 00:30:07,360

question can be answered by an

814

00:30:11,750 --> 00:30:10,000

application of the empirical sciences

815

00:30:14,310 --> 00:30:11,760

then i don't sign up to that but then

816

00:30:17,269 --> 00:30:14,320

the vast majority of scientists don't

817

00:30:18,950 --> 00:30:17,279

sign up to that either actually they

818

00:30:21,430 --> 00:30:18,960

acknowledge that moral questions for

819

00:30:23,669 --> 00:30:21,440

example are questions that science is

820

00:30:25,669 --> 00:30:23,679

not well placed to answer

821

00:30:27,590 --> 00:30:25,679

and many other questions too and in fact

822

00:30:29,669 --> 00:30:27,600

even richard dawkins in the god delusion

823

00:30:32,630 --> 00:30:29,679

makes it clear that he doesn't think

824

00:30:35,590 --> 00:30:32,640

that science can answer every question

825

00:30:39,029 --> 00:30:35,600

so very very few people actually are

826

00:30:41,430 --> 00:30:39,039

wedded to scientism um also very many

827

00:30:42,789 --> 00:30:41,440

scientists are not wedded to materialism

828

00:30:44,230 --> 00:30:42,799

because as a matter of fact they're

829

00:30:47,190 --> 00:30:44,240

religious

830

00:30:49,190 --> 00:30:47,200

right many christians are scientists

831

00:30:51,350 --> 00:30:49,200

they're clearly not materialists but

832

00:30:53,110 --> 00:30:51,360

they really do believe that by using

833

00:30:54,870 --> 00:30:53,120

science they can really understand a

834

00:30:57,029 --> 00:30:54,880

great deal of the world around us and

835

00:30:59,029 --> 00:30:57,039

indeed that science is the best tool for

836

00:31:01,750 --> 00:30:59,039

finding out about that world that we see

837

00:31:03,430 --> 00:31:01,760

around us so i just don't buy this oh

838

00:31:06,789 --> 00:31:03,440

science is all about materialism and

839

00:31:08,389 --> 00:31:06,799

scientism that just seems to me to be an

840

00:31:09,430 --> 00:31:08,399

excuse

841

00:31:12,389 --> 00:31:09,440

for

842

00:31:14,470 --> 00:31:12,399

a way of explaining a way why it is that

843

00:31:16,470 --> 00:31:14,480

maybe science scientists aren't signing

844

00:31:19,430 --> 00:31:16,480

up to what it is that sheldrake wants

845

00:31:21,909 --> 00:31:19,440

them to sign up to maybe well i i don't

846

00:31:24,149 --> 00:31:21,919

know on that last part i think there's a

847

00:31:26,789 --> 00:31:24,159

deeper point here when we talk about

848

00:31:27,830 --> 00:31:26,799

scientific materialism and this idea

849

00:31:29,590 --> 00:31:27,840

that

850

00:31:32,630 --> 00:31:29,600

you know when it comes down to it

851
00:31:33,909 --> 00:31:32,640
science is nothing if we can't measure

852
00:31:36,070 --> 00:31:33,919
things right

853
00:31:38,789 --> 00:31:36,080
and the notion that

854
00:31:41,430 --> 00:31:38,799
we are something more than our brain

855
00:31:43,830 --> 00:31:41,440
that mind equals brain isn't true we are

856
00:31:45,830 --> 00:31:43,840
not biological robots and you said

857
00:31:48,230 --> 00:31:45,840
earlier that falsifying that doesn't

858
00:31:50,310 --> 00:31:48,240
mean an end to atheism and we could go

859
00:31:52,870 --> 00:31:50,320
off on that discussion i think to a

860
00:31:56,149 --> 00:31:52,880
certain extent falsifying that does

861
00:31:58,389 --> 00:31:56,159
bring an end to scientific materialism

862
00:32:01,590 --> 00:31:58,399
in a way that it's currently deeply

863
00:32:04,070 --> 00:32:01,600

deeply embedded into our

864

00:32:07,110 --> 00:32:04,080

culture certainly into our academics and

865

00:32:09,830 --> 00:32:07,120

that is that you know what if mind does

866

00:32:11,750 --> 00:32:09,840

not equal brain if your mind isn't

867

00:32:14,389 --> 00:32:11,760

solely a result

868

00:32:16,470 --> 00:32:14,399

of the chemical neural activity

869

00:32:18,470 --> 00:32:16,480

inside your brain right now then we got

870

00:32:20,470 --> 00:32:18,480

a huge measurement problem and we have

871

00:32:22,710 --> 00:32:20,480

to start asking questions like you know

872

00:32:24,470 --> 00:32:22,720

how many angels fit on the head of a pin

873

00:32:26,630 --> 00:32:24,480

those kind of questions that we do you

874

00:32:29,430 --> 00:32:26,640

know we left long ago because we

875

00:32:31,269 --> 00:32:29,440

realized where they take us but i really

876

00:32:33,430 --> 00:32:31,279

think i don't know how you get around it

877

00:32:36,230 --> 00:32:33,440

from a philosophical standpoint i think

878

00:32:38,549 --> 00:32:36,240

that's what's at stake with this mind

879

00:32:41,350 --> 00:32:38,559

equals mind equals brain problem

880

00:32:42,389 --> 00:32:41,360

well i can see i can see that

881

00:32:44,549 --> 00:32:42,399

what you're doing there is you're saying

882

00:32:46,710 --> 00:32:44,559

well look here's a there's a veil here

883

00:32:48,230 --> 00:32:46,720

and the stuff this side of the veil i

884

00:32:50,389 --> 00:32:48,240

can put my tape measure up against it

885

00:32:52,149 --> 00:32:50,399

and i can measure it but hey if there's

886

00:32:53,669 --> 00:32:52,159

stuff behind the veil and i can't i

887

00:32:55,830 --> 00:32:53,679

can't get my tape measure back there and

888

00:32:58,230 --> 00:32:55,840

do the measuring because it's the mind

889

00:32:59,830 --> 00:32:58,240

and the mind isn't physical even

890

00:33:02,389 --> 00:32:59,840

then there's a real problem about

891

00:33:04,549 --> 00:33:02,399

scientific investigation of that

892

00:33:06,389 --> 00:33:04,559

phenomenon but i don't think i'm saying

893

00:33:08,310 --> 00:33:06,399

that i think that's what stephen hawking

894

00:33:09,830 --> 00:33:08,320

is saying i think that's what

895

00:33:12,149 --> 00:33:09,840

richard dawkin is saying i think that's

896

00:33:14,230 --> 00:33:12,159

what a lot of people are saying her like

897

00:33:16,789 --> 00:33:14,240

hey don't really go there too far

898

00:33:18,389 --> 00:33:16,799

because you don't want to fully embrace

899

00:33:19,830 --> 00:33:18,399

what that means but tell me why you

900

00:33:23,029 --> 00:33:19,840

don't think that's

901
00:33:24,630 --> 00:33:23,039
well just because something

902
00:33:26,230 --> 00:33:24,640
is not

903
00:33:28,230 --> 00:33:26,240
observable

904
00:33:30,190 --> 00:33:28,240
um doesn't mean that it's not

905
00:33:33,110 --> 00:33:30,200
scientifically

906
00:33:34,470 --> 00:33:33,120
investigable and science deals with well

907
00:33:35,909 --> 00:33:34,480
hello

908
00:33:37,669 --> 00:33:35,919
wait a minute i don't think that's true

909
00:33:39,430 --> 00:33:37,679
tell me tell me how that could

910
00:33:41,269 --> 00:33:39,440
how could we measure something we can't

911
00:33:43,110 --> 00:33:41,279
observe well you can investigate things

912
00:33:44,950 --> 00:33:43,120
by investigating their effects you can't

913
00:33:46,710 --> 00:33:44,960

observe electrons

914

00:33:49,350 --> 00:33:46,720

you can't observe

915

00:33:52,470 --> 00:33:49,360

the distant past of this planet you

916

00:33:54,470 --> 00:33:52,480

cannot observe a living dinosaur

917

00:33:57,430 --> 00:33:54,480

um all of these things are beyond our

918

00:33:59,350 --> 00:33:57,440

ability to observe but we can still draw

919

00:34:01,350 --> 00:33:59,360

reasonable conclusions about these

920

00:34:02,630 --> 00:34:01,360

portions these unobserved portions of

921

00:34:03,990 --> 00:34:02,640

reality

922

00:34:06,630 --> 00:34:04,000

by

923

00:34:07,430 --> 00:34:06,640

thinking through the consequences

924

00:34:09,829 --> 00:34:07,440

of

925

00:34:12,149 --> 00:34:09,839

beliefs in such things if it's true that

926
00:34:15,030 --> 00:34:12,159
dinosaurs once roamed the earth then we

927
00:34:17,589 --> 00:34:15,040
should find certain things

928
00:34:19,270 --> 00:34:17,599
embedded in the ground now for example

929
00:34:21,430 --> 00:34:19,280
there should be certain clues that we

930
00:34:24,069 --> 00:34:21,440
should be able to discover if it's true

931
00:34:26,790 --> 00:34:24,079
that crystals have certain effects on

932
00:34:29,669 --> 00:34:26,800
people's psyches by some supernatural

933
00:34:31,510 --> 00:34:29,679
means we can do some experiments to see

934
00:34:33,030 --> 00:34:31,520
double blind experiments to see whether

935
00:34:35,669 --> 00:34:33,040
or not the crystals have those kinds of

936
00:34:38,069 --> 00:34:35,679
effects if prayer has the ability to

937
00:34:39,589 --> 00:34:38,079
cure people then we can do again

938
00:34:41,750 --> 00:34:39,599

double-blind experiments and they've

939

00:34:44,149 --> 00:34:41,760

been done to see whether petitionary

940

00:34:46,790 --> 00:34:44,159

prayer really does have the ability to

941

00:34:49,270 --> 00:34:46,800

cure heart patients so so just because

942

00:34:51,829 --> 00:34:49,280

the just because the phenomenon itself

943

00:34:53,750 --> 00:34:51,839

is behind the screen doesn't mean that

944

00:34:55,270 --> 00:34:53,760

you can't actually empirically

945

00:34:56,869 --> 00:34:55,280

investigate it and i thought that

946

00:35:00,310 --> 00:34:56,879

actually rupert sheldrake was very much

947

00:35:02,150 --> 00:35:00,320

in favor of that kind of investigation

948

00:35:04,950 --> 00:35:02,160

i think he is but i think what he's

949

00:35:06,710 --> 00:35:04,960

alluding to is that we have to be

950

00:35:08,870 --> 00:35:06,720

cautious in the same way you're talking

951
00:35:10,870 --> 00:35:08,880
about in a way that's why i like to

952
00:35:12,470 --> 00:35:10,880
juxtapose those two quotes yours and his

953
00:35:14,470 --> 00:35:12,480
because in a way you're talking about

954
00:35:16,630 --> 00:35:14,480
the same thing about sweeping mystery

955
00:35:18,069 --> 00:35:16,640
under the rug and what sheldrick is

956
00:35:21,270 --> 00:35:18,079
warning us is

957
00:35:23,910 --> 00:35:21,280
don't think that science isn't already

958
00:35:26,230 --> 00:35:23,920
sweeping a whole lot of mystery under

959
00:35:27,829 --> 00:35:26,240
the rug i i always think of the quote

960
00:35:29,990 --> 00:35:27,839
from the famous

961
00:35:31,990 --> 00:35:30,000
physicist richard feynman who says

962
00:35:34,950 --> 00:35:32,000
anyone who claims to understand quantum

963
00:35:38,390 --> 00:35:34,960

theory is either lying or crazy right so

964

00:35:40,790 --> 00:35:38,400

there's a whole lot of mystery that is

965

00:35:43,270 --> 00:35:40,800

at the core of physics as we understand

966

00:35:45,270 --> 00:35:43,280

it that we just conveniently sweep under

967

00:35:47,589 --> 00:35:45,280

the rug because we don't want to deal

968

00:35:49,670 --> 00:35:47,599

with it or as you put it we put it on

969

00:35:51,430 --> 00:35:49,680

the other side of the veil and say oh we

970

00:35:53,430 --> 00:35:51,440

can't really understand it but we can

971

00:35:55,430 --> 00:35:53,440

kind of fool around with measuring these

972

00:35:56,950 --> 00:35:55,440

effects when i think what you've really

973

00:35:59,829 --> 00:35:56,960

done is you've kind of switched the game

974

00:36:02,310 --> 00:35:59,839

here because the game was about

975

00:36:04,069 --> 00:36:02,320

that we have this closed loop system

976
00:36:06,069 --> 00:36:04,079
everything that is physical is

977
00:36:08,230 --> 00:36:06,079
manifested in a way that we can measure

978
00:36:10,150 --> 00:36:08,240
and measure it and if we change that

979
00:36:11,750 --> 00:36:10,160
assumption i really think we've kind of

980
00:36:12,630 --> 00:36:11,760
changed the game in a fundamental way

981
00:36:14,870 --> 00:36:12,640
but

982
00:36:17,030 --> 00:36:14,880
obviously you kind of see it somewhat

983
00:36:17,829 --> 00:36:17,040
differently i have no problem at all

984
00:36:21,430 --> 00:36:17,839
with

985
00:36:22,870 --> 00:36:21,440
acknowledging that some things are

986
00:36:24,829 --> 00:36:22,880
currently beyond our understanding and

987
00:36:27,910 --> 00:36:24,839
maybe in principle beyond our

988
00:36:29,670 --> 00:36:27,920

understanding um my problem is with

989

00:36:33,270 --> 00:36:29,680

those who

990

00:36:35,670 --> 00:36:33,280

when their belief in some phenomenon

991

00:36:37,510 --> 00:36:35,680

has been challenged

992

00:36:39,030 --> 00:36:37,520

they say

993

00:36:40,550 --> 00:36:39,040

you know there's a serious intellectual

994

00:36:42,230 --> 00:36:40,560

threat the evidence very strongly

995

00:36:44,069 --> 00:36:42,240

suggests that what they believe is not

996

00:36:46,069 --> 00:36:44,079

true say they believe in petitionary

997

00:36:48,550 --> 00:36:46,079

prayer or they believe that miracles

998

00:36:50,950 --> 00:36:48,560

have some so um crystals have some

999

00:36:52,870 --> 00:36:50,960

amazing effect on people's psyche and

1000

00:36:54,470 --> 00:36:52,880

the experiments are done and the

1001
00:36:56,550 --> 00:36:54,480
evidence is in and it looks very much as

1002
00:36:58,550 --> 00:36:56,560
if it's simply not true and they respond

1003
00:37:00,630 --> 00:36:58,560
by saying yes but there are more things

1004
00:37:02,710 --> 00:37:00,640
in heaven and hell than a dreamt of in

1005
00:37:04,390 --> 00:37:02,720
your philosophy correct that's what they

1006
00:37:06,150 --> 00:37:04,400
say at that point and what they're doing

1007
00:37:08,390 --> 00:37:06,160
now is they're using the veil as an

1008
00:37:09,990 --> 00:37:08,400
immunizing device to protect what they

1009
00:37:13,670 --> 00:37:10,000
believe

1010
00:37:15,270 --> 00:37:13,680
from any kind of threat and now that is

1011
00:37:17,990 --> 00:37:15,280
it seems to me intellectually very

1012
00:37:20,470 --> 00:37:18,000
dubious indeed to some extent we all do

1013
00:37:22,390 --> 00:37:20,480

that a little bit but the more you do it

1014

00:37:25,109 --> 00:37:22,400

the more vulnerable you become to

1015

00:37:28,069 --> 00:37:25,119

deceive by others and by yourself you

1016

00:37:29,589 --> 00:37:28,079

end up kidding yourself in the end so

1017

00:37:31,030 --> 00:37:29,599

it's that kind of appeal to mystery that

1018

00:37:33,109 --> 00:37:31,040

bothers me i have no problem with

1019

00:37:35,270 --> 00:37:33,119

mystery hey there are plenty of them and

1020

00:37:37,190 --> 00:37:35,280

they inspire us to keep looking and keep

1021

00:37:39,190 --> 00:37:37,200

searching and it may be that some will

1022

00:37:41,670 --> 00:37:39,200

never be solved and it may be that they

1023

00:37:45,190 --> 00:37:41,680

are necessarily unsolvable but let's not

1024

00:37:46,950 --> 00:37:45,200

use mystery as a kind of get out of jail

1025

00:37:48,710 --> 00:37:46,960

card whenever we find ourselves cornered

1026

00:37:49,750 --> 00:37:48,720

in an argument i mean that's that's not

1027

00:37:51,990 --> 00:37:49,760

all

1028

00:37:54,870 --> 00:37:52,000

no fair enough but as you know you're

1029

00:37:57,430 --> 00:37:54,880

also provost for the center for inquiry

1030

00:38:00,150 --> 00:37:57,440

in the uk which i'm not sure how it's

1031

00:38:01,430 --> 00:38:00,160

perceived in the uk but in the u.s is

1032

00:38:03,990 --> 00:38:01,440

known as

1033

00:38:07,030 --> 00:38:04,000

basically a debunking organization for

1034

00:38:10,069 --> 00:38:07,040

all manner of paranormal claims and that

1035

00:38:11,589 --> 00:38:10,079

kind of leads me into directly into this

1036

00:38:13,750 --> 00:38:11,599

last topic i want to talk to you about

1037

00:38:15,109 --> 00:38:13,760

in terms of philosophy of science and

1038

00:38:16,710 --> 00:38:15,119

gosh as you were saying that what just

1039

00:38:18,550 --> 00:38:16,720

kept ringing through my ears is what i

1040

00:38:20,310 --> 00:38:18,560

hear all the time this idea of

1041

00:38:22,150 --> 00:38:20,320

extraordinary claims require

1042

00:38:25,829 --> 00:38:22,160

extraordinary proof i mean you want to

1043

00:38:27,750 --> 00:38:25,839

talk about sweeping mystery sweeping

1044

00:38:32,310 --> 00:38:27,760

evidence that you don't like under the

1045

00:38:35,190 --> 00:38:32,320

rug here is the mantra that the whole

1046

00:38:36,230 --> 00:38:35,200

center for inquiry crowd pulls out i

1047

00:38:38,470 --> 00:38:36,240

mean

1048

00:38:41,910 --> 00:38:38,480

i guess i should start with that

1049

00:38:43,109 --> 00:38:41,920

i see that as just an intellectually

1050

00:38:45,510 --> 00:38:43,119

feeble

1051
00:38:48,230 --> 00:38:45,520
kind of pronouncement extraordinary

1052
00:38:53,030 --> 00:38:48,240
claims require extraordinary proof that

1053
00:38:56,550 --> 00:38:54,710
why do you think that

1054
00:38:59,510 --> 00:38:56,560
well well we've built this whole

1055
00:39:01,829 --> 00:38:59,520
institution of science the whole process

1056
00:39:04,390 --> 00:39:01,839
of peer review the whole process of

1057
00:39:08,390 --> 00:39:04,400
self-correction around this idea that

1058
00:39:11,109 --> 00:39:08,400
that we will all together discover what

1059
00:39:14,470 --> 00:39:11,119
is real what is not real what is

1060
00:39:17,109 --> 00:39:14,480
extraordinary what is not extraordinary

1061
00:39:19,270 --> 00:39:17,119
so then the idea that that kind of after

1062
00:39:21,510 --> 00:39:19,280
the fact after the results come in we

1063
00:39:23,349 --> 00:39:21,520

say you know that's pretty interesting

1064

00:39:26,230 --> 00:39:23,359

results but i deem that to be

1065

00:39:28,950 --> 00:39:26,240

extraordinary therefore you need an

1066

00:39:31,670 --> 00:39:28,960

extra level of proof on that i i i just

1067

00:39:33,109 --> 00:39:31,680

think is is just silly

1068

00:39:34,470 --> 00:39:33,119

oh okay i think that's where you're

1069

00:39:36,870 --> 00:39:34,480

coming from well the way i have

1070

00:39:38,710 --> 00:39:36,880

understood uh that principle

1071

00:39:40,950 --> 00:39:38,720

extraordinary claims require

1072

00:39:44,790 --> 00:39:40,960

extraordinary evidence is

1073

00:39:46,710 --> 00:39:44,800

that well i mean suppose suppose um

1074

00:39:49,430 --> 00:39:46,720

i tell you that over there

1075

00:39:52,069 --> 00:39:49,440

um i've got uh

1076

00:39:54,710 --> 00:39:52,079

a mobile phone and a cup okay

1077

00:39:56,950 --> 00:39:54,720

um and i do this there's the mobile

1078

00:39:58,710 --> 00:39:56,960

phone in the cup um you're gonna go hey

1079

00:40:00,950 --> 00:39:58,720

yeah that's good enough for me

1080

00:40:03,349 --> 00:40:00,960

steve's got a mobile phone and a cup if

1081

00:40:05,030 --> 00:40:03,359

i now wheel out a um a fairy which i may

1082

00:40:06,310 --> 00:40:05,040

dance on the end of my finger and i go

1083

00:40:08,069 --> 00:40:06,320

there you go ferry on the end of my

1084

00:40:09,430 --> 00:40:08,079

finger okay are you gonna go yeah

1085

00:40:11,190 --> 00:40:09,440

steve's got a fury on the end of his

1086

00:40:14,710 --> 00:40:11,200

finger i'll just take his that fair

1087

00:40:16,870 --> 00:40:14,720

enough i'll i'll i'll accept that while

1088

00:40:18,230 --> 00:40:16,880

on on this on the basis of the same kind

1089

00:40:20,550 --> 00:40:18,240

of evidence that i accept that he's got

1090

00:40:22,390 --> 00:40:20,560

a cup on my mobile phone i bet you would

1091

00:40:23,829 --> 00:40:22,400

not sure sure but we're talking about

1092

00:40:25,510 --> 00:40:23,839

we're talking about science here we're

1093

00:40:27,510 --> 00:40:25,520

talking about peer review here's the

1094

00:40:29,270 --> 00:40:27,520

example that i i sent you and i have

1095

00:40:31,829 --> 00:40:29,280

personal experience with because he told

1096

00:40:34,310 --> 00:40:31,839

it to me and we discussed it on this

1097

00:40:36,870 --> 00:40:34,320

show and that's british psychologist and

1098

00:40:39,510 --> 00:40:36,880

parapsychology critic richard wiseman

1099

00:40:42,310 --> 00:40:39,520

who has investigated probably more of

1100

00:40:44,230 --> 00:40:42,320

these paranormal parapsychology

1101
00:40:46,870 --> 00:40:44,240
claims like telepathy than just about

1102
00:40:49,349 --> 00:40:46,880
anybody else and here's his quote

1103
00:40:51,910 --> 00:40:49,359
i agree that by the standards of any

1104
00:40:54,390 --> 00:40:51,920
other area of science that remote

1105
00:40:55,589 --> 00:40:54,400
viewing and he later added in this quote

1106
00:40:57,990 --> 00:40:55,599
esp

1107
00:40:59,990 --> 00:40:58,000
is proven but that begs the question do

1108
00:41:02,710 --> 00:41:00,000
we need higher standards of evidence

1109
00:41:04,950 --> 00:41:02,720
when we study the paranormal so stephen

1110
00:41:06,790 --> 00:41:04,960
this is not you know the fairy in the

1111
00:41:09,270 --> 00:41:06,800
cup over here this is a guy who's

1112
00:41:11,349 --> 00:41:09,280
reviewed hundreds of peer-reviewed

1113
00:41:14,150 --> 00:41:11,359

papers and saying you know what

1114

00:41:17,270 --> 00:41:14,160

it's good enough for any other field but

1115

00:41:18,109 --> 00:41:17,280

you know what not good enough because of

1116

00:41:19,670 --> 00:41:18,119

the

1117

00:41:23,030 --> 00:41:19,680

groundbreaking

1118

00:41:25,109 --> 00:41:23,040

kind of upset it would make for science

1119

00:41:26,870 --> 00:41:25,119

i think this is the best evidence i

1120

00:41:31,030 --> 00:41:26,880

could give you for my claim about

1121

00:41:35,990 --> 00:41:31,040

scientific materialism being woven into

1122

00:41:39,430 --> 00:41:37,910

presumably you wouldn't accept you know

1123

00:41:41,190 --> 00:41:39,440

if i stick my finger out there and there

1124

00:41:43,030 --> 00:41:41,200

appears to be a finger a sort of fairy

1125

00:41:44,950 --> 00:41:43,040

spinning around on the end of it you're

1126
00:41:46,390 --> 00:41:44,960
going to be very very suspicious you're

1127
00:41:48,069 --> 00:41:46,400
not just going to say

1128
00:41:51,670 --> 00:41:48,079
yeah steven's proved to me that there

1129
00:41:54,309 --> 00:41:51,680
are fairies uh you're gonna require

1130
00:41:55,990 --> 00:41:54,319
a much more investigation before you

1131
00:41:57,750 --> 00:41:56,000
take my word for it that there really is

1132
00:41:59,910 --> 00:41:57,760
a fairies uh spinning around on the end

1133
00:42:00,870 --> 00:41:59,920
of my finger and why is that it's

1134
00:42:01,990 --> 00:42:00,880
because

1135
00:42:03,990 --> 00:42:02,000
you know

1136
00:42:06,470 --> 00:42:04,000
the the prior probability that anything

1137
00:42:08,870 --> 00:42:06,480
like a theory exists is very very low

1138
00:42:10,390 --> 00:42:08,880

indeed knowing what we do you know given

1139

00:42:12,150 --> 00:42:10,400

our background

1140

00:42:13,670 --> 00:42:12,160

you you don't even believe this you

1141

00:42:17,270 --> 00:42:13,680

don't even believe this yourself again

1142

00:42:21,030 --> 00:42:17,280

the quote is by by the standards of any

1143

00:42:24,470 --> 00:42:21,040

other area of science this is proven he

1144

00:42:27,270 --> 00:42:24,480

is talking about creating another level

1145

00:42:30,150 --> 00:42:27,280

of proof a completely arbitrary level of

1146

00:42:32,470 --> 00:42:30,160

proof based on his beliefs of what is

1147

00:42:35,430 --> 00:42:32,480

extraordinary in terms of a claim and

1148

00:42:37,589 --> 00:42:35,440

extraordinary in terms of proof

1149

00:42:39,750 --> 00:42:37,599

there's no way to intellectually defend

1150

00:42:41,589 --> 00:42:39,760

this statement it's but it is

1151
00:42:43,349 --> 00:42:41,599
there is because look i mean when the

1152
00:42:44,870 --> 00:42:43,359
scientist what the scientist is there

1153
00:42:47,270 --> 00:42:44,880
are certain things that the scientist is

1154
00:42:48,950 --> 00:42:47,280
going to take as rig you know um

1155
00:42:50,230 --> 00:42:48,960
he's going to take it that the dial

1156
00:42:51,670 --> 00:42:50,240
really does you know that really is

1157
00:42:52,710 --> 00:42:51,680
number one on the dial he can see it

1158
00:42:55,030 --> 00:42:52,720
right there

1159
00:42:57,510 --> 00:42:55,040
um that that that's not going to be a

1160
00:42:59,349 --> 00:42:57,520
problem so far so far as uh he's

1161
00:43:01,910 --> 00:42:59,359
concerned or she is concerned it's not

1162
00:43:04,309 --> 00:43:01,920
being sexist about this okay so there

1163
00:43:05,670 --> 00:43:04,319

are certain things that uh

1164

00:43:07,910 --> 00:43:05,680

we're going to take on the basis of

1165

00:43:09,190 --> 00:43:07,920

that's just how things appear to be and

1166

00:43:11,190 --> 00:43:09,200

scientists do that even in the

1167

00:43:12,790 --> 00:43:11,200

laboratory they're going to do that

1168

00:43:14,150 --> 00:43:12,800

although they'll hopefully go away and

1169

00:43:15,510 --> 00:43:14,160

repeat the experiment and other people

1170

00:43:16,470 --> 00:43:15,520

will do the same kind of thing but again

1171

00:43:19,190 --> 00:43:16,480

they'll just look at the doll and say

1172

00:43:21,750 --> 00:43:19,200

yeah number one okay let's carry on so

1173

00:43:24,150 --> 00:43:21,760

it's not it's it's not the extent to

1174

00:43:26,950 --> 00:43:24,160

which we raise the evidential bar

1175

00:43:28,950 --> 00:43:26,960

depends on

1176

00:43:32,309 --> 00:43:28,960

just how

1177

00:43:35,190 --> 00:43:32,319

extraordinary the claim is how unlikely

1178

00:43:36,950 --> 00:43:35,200

how likely it is that we would

1179

00:43:40,069 --> 00:43:36,960

have the evidence if the claim is true

1180

00:43:42,309 --> 00:43:40,079

and how unlikely it would be that we

1181

00:43:44,390 --> 00:43:42,319

would have the evidence if the claim

1182

00:43:46,150 --> 00:43:44,400

wasn't true but isn't that what science

1183

00:43:48,069 --> 00:43:46,160

is doing isn't that what science is

1184

00:43:50,069 --> 00:43:48,079

doing all the time isn't that what the

1185

00:43:52,870 --> 00:43:50,079

peer review process is doing is

1186

00:43:54,790 --> 00:43:52,880

determining what evidence we already

1187

00:43:55,990 --> 00:43:54,800

have as our base what new evidence we

1188

00:43:57,270 --> 00:43:56,000

should consider

1189

00:43:58,790 --> 00:43:57,280

why

1190

00:44:00,150 --> 00:43:58,800

maybe your maybe your view is that you

1191

00:44:01,510 --> 00:44:00,160

know there is already an awful lot of

1192

00:44:04,309 --> 00:44:01,520

evidence in

1193

00:44:06,150 --> 00:44:04,319

for the existence of psychic powers uh

1194

00:44:08,470 --> 00:44:06,160

say enough evidence that by the

1195

00:44:10,790 --> 00:44:08,480

standards of any other area of science

1196

00:44:12,790 --> 00:44:10,800

it's proven those are are wise men's

1197

00:44:14,069 --> 00:44:12,800

words yeah that's true

1198

00:44:16,150 --> 00:44:14,079

i can't comment on that because i'm not

1199

00:44:18,069 --> 00:44:16,160

an expert on that area of science but

1200

00:44:20,230 --> 00:44:18,079

let's suppose that that's true um i

1201

00:44:21,910 --> 00:44:20,240

guess what wiseman is

1202

00:44:23,990 --> 00:44:21,920

saying here i mean and that might be

1203

00:44:26,790 --> 00:44:24,000

true for what i know um

1204

00:44:28,550 --> 00:44:26,800

and it's not that i would i would

1205

00:44:30,390 --> 00:44:28,560

always refuse to believe that there was

1206

00:44:32,790 --> 00:44:30,400

psychic powers as a matter of fact i

1207

00:44:36,470 --> 00:44:32,800

don't um but i'm certainly open to

1208

00:44:37,990 --> 00:44:36,480

persuasion but i know for example that

1209

00:44:40,630 --> 00:44:38,000

scientists

1210

00:44:43,349 --> 00:44:40,640

can be a little bit unreliable when it

1211

00:44:46,069 --> 00:44:43,359

comes to investigating psychic phenomena

1212

00:44:48,550 --> 00:44:46,079

they have been duped they had their it's

1213

00:44:50,790 --> 00:44:48,560

on record it has been established that

1214

00:44:53,349 --> 00:44:50,800

scientists are really really good when

1215

00:44:55,270 --> 00:44:53,359

it comes to chemicals in a petri dish

1216

00:44:57,349 --> 00:44:55,280

but when it comes to a couple of people

1217

00:44:59,589 --> 00:44:57,359

in front of them they can they are

1218

00:45:01,829 --> 00:44:59,599

vulnerable to the same kind of

1219

00:45:03,750 --> 00:45:01,839

moves into seeds that the rest of us are

1220

00:45:05,910 --> 00:45:03,760

it turns out they don't have any special

1221

00:45:08,790 --> 00:45:05,920

expertise when it comes to investigating

1222

00:45:10,710 --> 00:45:08,800

someone like yuri gellar for example it

1223

00:45:12,230 --> 00:45:10,720

turns out that they are they will fall

1224

00:45:13,510 --> 00:45:12,240

for the same tricks as the man in the

1225

00:45:16,069 --> 00:45:13,520

street so

1226

00:45:18,470 --> 00:45:16,079

you have to be extra extra specially

1227

00:45:20,470 --> 00:45:18,480

careful when it comes to investigating

1228

00:45:21,750 --> 00:45:20,480

those kinds of things and

1229

00:45:23,750 --> 00:45:21,760

i i can't believe that you would

1230

00:45:27,750 --> 00:45:23,760

disagree with me about that would you

1231

00:45:30,870 --> 00:45:27,760

intellectual black hole alert dr law

1232

00:45:33,430 --> 00:45:30,880

this is exactly what you preach against

1233

00:45:36,309 --> 00:45:33,440

in is that we are going to layer on top

1234

00:45:38,710 --> 00:45:36,319

of this without any proof without any

1235

00:45:41,109 --> 00:45:38,720

evidence i mean if that's your claim

1236

00:45:43,670 --> 00:45:41,119

then someone needs to prove that as

1237

00:45:45,510 --> 00:45:43,680

they've tried to do so many times and as

1238

00:45:47,270 --> 00:45:45,520

the social scientists

1239

00:45:48,870 --> 00:45:47,280

well wait a minute they really we could

1240

00:45:51,190 --> 00:45:48,880

get into that evidence and talk about

1241

00:45:53,430 --> 00:45:51,200

that but i think what you'd find is that

1242

00:45:54,109 --> 00:45:53,440

all the work that's been done suggests

1243

00:45:57,349 --> 00:45:54,119

that

1244

00:46:00,550 --> 00:45:57,359

parapsychology stands above virtually

1245

00:46:03,589 --> 00:46:00,560

every other area of science in terms of

1246

00:46:06,309 --> 00:46:03,599

controlling for these kinds of

1247

00:46:08,790 --> 00:46:06,319

lack of controls because they've been

1248

00:46:10,630 --> 00:46:08,800

under such scrutiny for the last 50

1249

00:46:12,870 --> 00:46:10,640

years that they're more aware of this

1250

00:46:15,190 --> 00:46:12,880

than anyone else that's what the hard

1251
00:46:17,990 --> 00:46:15,200
date that's what the hard data tells us

1252
00:46:19,750 --> 00:46:18,000
but i i again i just think the idea that

1253
00:46:22,950 --> 00:46:19,760
that we need to

1254
00:46:25,349 --> 00:46:22,960
kind of layer on top of science

1255
00:46:28,790 --> 00:46:25,359
the the center for a lot of these people

1256
00:46:30,550 --> 00:46:28,800
are investigating and finding nothing

1257
00:46:32,390 --> 00:46:30,560
they can't replicate the experiments

1258
00:46:33,990 --> 00:46:32,400
they do not get the same results when

1259
00:46:37,190 --> 00:46:34,000
they repeat the experiments that

1260
00:46:38,470 --> 00:46:37,200
supposedly show the psychic effect there

1261
00:46:41,349 --> 00:46:38,480
is not the repeating that you would

1262
00:46:44,230 --> 00:46:41,359
expect and so at the very least you

1263
00:46:45,829 --> 00:46:44,240

should be a little bit skeptical here

1264

00:46:46,790 --> 00:46:45,839

you know you shouldn't just assume that

1265

00:46:48,309 --> 00:46:46,800

the reason they're not getting the

1266

00:46:49,349 --> 00:46:48,319

result with the results when wiseman

1267

00:46:50,470 --> 00:46:49,359

does the experiment he doesn't get the

1268

00:46:51,670 --> 00:46:50,480

results when chris french does the

1269

00:46:53,589 --> 00:46:51,680

experiment he doesn't get the results

1270

00:46:55,349 --> 00:46:53,599

when randy does the experiment he

1271

00:46:58,870 --> 00:46:55,359

doesn't get the results but rihanna

1272

00:47:01,430 --> 00:46:58,880

randy you really want to throw randy in

1273

00:47:03,430 --> 00:47:01,440

into a serious scientific debate and

1274

00:47:05,190 --> 00:47:03,440

again if that's your claim if that's

1275

00:47:07,349 --> 00:47:05,200

your claim then you would you would have

1276

00:47:10,230 --> 00:47:07,359

to back that you would have to back that

1277

00:47:12,790 --> 00:47:10,240

up i think we're going to get way into

1278

00:47:14,230 --> 00:47:12,800

uh you know the details of those

1279

00:47:16,630 --> 00:47:14,240

experiments which we've done on this

1280

00:47:19,910 --> 00:47:16,640

show many times but it's really i think

1281

00:47:21,750 --> 00:47:19,920

uh probably outside of the the aim of

1282

00:47:23,750 --> 00:47:21,760

having you on and talking about the

1283

00:47:26,230 --> 00:47:23,760

philosophy of it which i think you've

1284

00:47:28,470 --> 00:47:26,240

handled in a in an admirable way and

1285

00:47:29,510 --> 00:47:28,480

i've used up i think about all of our

1286

00:47:31,030 --> 00:47:29,520

time

1287

00:47:32,870 --> 00:47:31,040

let's switch gears for a minute if we

1288

00:47:35,990 --> 00:47:32,880

could and get off

1289

00:47:38,230 --> 00:47:36,000

oh go go ahead no no please punish it

1290

00:47:40,790 --> 00:47:38,240

the principle that extraordinary claims

1291

00:47:43,750 --> 00:47:40,800

require extraordinary evidence i think

1292

00:47:45,270 --> 00:47:43,760

actually is is self-evidently true if

1293

00:47:47,990 --> 00:47:45,280

you think about it in the right kind of

1294

00:47:49,670 --> 00:47:48,000

way and in fact you if you understand it

1295

00:47:51,990 --> 00:47:49,680

in the right kind of way certainly if i

1296

00:47:53,190 --> 00:47:52,000

claim to have a thing a fairy you know

1297

00:47:54,870 --> 00:47:53,200

in front of you and i show you what

1298

00:47:57,510 --> 00:47:54,880

appears to be a fairy on your little tv

1299

00:47:58,790 --> 00:47:57,520

screen there dancing away on my hand you

1300

00:48:00,390 --> 00:47:58,800

you're not just you're not going to take

1301
00:48:01,670 --> 00:48:00,400
that at face value in the same way that

1302
00:48:03,910 --> 00:48:01,680
you would take it that i have a cup of

1303
00:48:05,990 --> 00:48:03,920
my hand clearly as the claim becomes

1304
00:48:08,150 --> 00:48:06,000
more and more extraordinary so the

1305
00:48:09,589 --> 00:48:08,160
evidential bar has to be raised and we

1306
00:48:11,829 --> 00:48:09,599
all know that and when it comes to

1307
00:48:13,910 --> 00:48:11,839
claims about psychic powers and so on

1308
00:48:16,870 --> 00:48:13,920
these are very very extraordinary claims

1309
00:48:18,630 --> 00:48:16,880
they do not fit in with our theory our

1310
00:48:20,150 --> 00:48:18,640
best understanding of how the universe

1311
00:48:21,349 --> 00:48:20,160
works and so if you're going to make

1312
00:48:23,589 --> 00:48:21,359
those claims you're going to have to

1313
00:48:25,589 --> 00:48:23,599

have better evidence than the kind of

1314

00:48:27,829 --> 00:48:25,599

evidence that you would already or you

1315

00:48:29,670 --> 00:48:27,839

know ordinarily expect to have the

1316

00:48:31,190 --> 00:48:29,680

principle that extraordinary claims

1317

00:48:33,109 --> 00:48:31,200

require extraordinary evidence seems to

1318

00:48:33,990 --> 00:48:33,119

me a very sensible

1319

00:48:36,470 --> 00:48:34,000

client

1320

00:48:38,790 --> 00:48:36,480

well well it it seems sensible in the

1321

00:48:40,470 --> 00:48:38,800

same way that communism seems sensible

1322

00:48:43,430 --> 00:48:40,480

and that we should share everything

1323

00:48:45,430 --> 00:48:43,440

among everyone except the devil of

1324

00:48:48,549 --> 00:48:45,440

course is in the details and that's who

1325

00:48:51,430 --> 00:48:48,559

decides what is shared with whom and so

1326
00:48:53,670 --> 00:48:51,440
is the problem with extraordinary claims

1327
00:48:55,829 --> 00:48:53,680
require extraordinary proof who will

1328
00:48:57,190 --> 00:48:55,839
decide i agree with you know that's good

1329
00:48:58,230 --> 00:48:57,200
yes you're coming on board with the

1330
00:49:00,549 --> 00:48:58,240
clapping

1331
00:49:02,549 --> 00:49:00,559
well i i guess i guess i'm coming on

1332
00:49:04,870 --> 00:49:02,559
board if we had this

1333
00:49:07,190 --> 00:49:04,880
omnipotent all-knowing

1334
00:49:09,430 --> 00:49:07,200
being that could decide what is

1335
00:49:11,589 --> 00:49:09,440
extraordinary in terms of claim and what

1336
00:49:13,349 --> 00:49:11,599
is extraordinary in terms of proof but i

1337
00:49:15,990 --> 00:49:13,359
would submit to you that that's why

1338
00:49:17,750 --> 00:49:16,000

we've built the scientific institutions

1339

00:49:21,510 --> 00:49:17,760

that we have that's why we have peer

1340

00:49:23,990 --> 00:49:21,520

review that's why we have a a a college

1341

00:49:25,750 --> 00:49:24,000

of academics who collectively create

1342

00:49:28,069 --> 00:49:25,760

this body of knowledge they are

1343

00:49:30,309 --> 00:49:28,079

constantly in the business of

1344

00:49:33,190 --> 00:49:30,319

extraordinary claims and extraordinary

1345

00:49:35,829 --> 00:49:33,200

proof and the notion that that we could

1346

00:49:37,750 --> 00:49:35,839

as a kind this armchair quarterback say

1347

00:49:40,150 --> 00:49:37,760

hey that area over there is

1348

00:49:43,829 --> 00:49:40,160

extraordinary i think is absurd i think

1349

00:49:45,990 --> 00:49:43,839

there's a thousands of little areas of

1350

00:49:47,990 --> 00:49:46,000

inquiry of science that we know nothing

1351
00:49:49,910 --> 00:49:48,000
about that if we went into we might

1352
00:49:52,230 --> 00:49:49,920
think wow that is extraordinary we just

1353
00:49:55,030 --> 00:49:52,240
don't know anything about it psychics

1354
00:49:57,910 --> 00:49:55,040
because they're on tv strike us as

1355
00:50:00,150 --> 00:49:57,920
extraordinary but to the researchers who

1356
00:50:02,069 --> 00:50:00,160
are in that field who are publishing in

1357
00:50:04,549 --> 00:50:02,079
those peer-reviewed journals who are

1358
00:50:06,230 --> 00:50:04,559
subjecting themselves to the criticism

1359
00:50:07,750 --> 00:50:06,240
of the best critics

1360
00:50:09,510 --> 00:50:07,760
are

1361
00:50:11,270 --> 00:50:09,520
some being

1362
00:50:13,109 --> 00:50:11,280
well some always i mean

1363
00:50:15,430 --> 00:50:13,119

some isn't really a qualifier here if

1364

00:50:16,309 --> 00:50:15,440

it's a qualifier all the time i'm just

1365

00:50:18,470 --> 00:50:16,319

saying

1366

00:50:21,109 --> 00:50:18,480

how would we layer on top of this this

1367

00:50:23,829 --> 00:50:21,119

notion of extraordinary how would we how

1368

00:50:26,470 --> 00:50:23,839

is the center for inquiry in any

1369

00:50:29,349 --> 00:50:26,480

position to be the arbitrary

1370

00:50:30,950 --> 00:50:29,359

of what is extraordinary even the people

1371

00:50:35,030 --> 00:50:30,960

doing the research think these claims

1372

00:50:38,230 --> 00:50:35,040

are extraordinary they will they will be

1373

00:50:39,910 --> 00:50:38,240

trumpeting from the rooftops if it turns

1374

00:50:41,589 --> 00:50:39,920

out they really can establish that some

1375

00:50:44,630 --> 00:50:41,599

people have psychic powers that is

1376

00:50:47,109 --> 00:50:44,640

absolutely extraordinary and you know it

1377

00:50:49,349 --> 00:50:47,119

it's exciting in a way that some other

1378

00:50:52,390 --> 00:50:49,359

rather more mundane scientific discovery

1379

00:50:54,309 --> 00:50:52,400

is not these are extraordinary claims

1380

00:50:55,589 --> 00:50:54,319

and it may be that we can establish that

1381

00:50:57,430 --> 00:50:55,599

they are true and it may be that the

1382

00:50:59,270 --> 00:50:57,440

extraordinary evidence is in hey i don't

1383

00:51:00,950 --> 00:50:59,280

know but so far so far as i'm aware

1384

00:51:03,190 --> 00:51:00,960

there are very many people working in

1385

00:51:05,910 --> 00:51:03,200

this area working very very hard who are

1386

00:51:07,349 --> 00:51:05,920

genuinely open-minded who just can't see

1387

00:51:09,109 --> 00:51:07,359

the evidence and they don't get the

1388

00:51:11,349 --> 00:51:09,119

results that other people do when they

1389

00:51:12,710 --> 00:51:11,359

repeat the experiments and on that basis

1390

00:51:14,549 --> 00:51:12,720

then i think

1391

00:51:16,790 --> 00:51:14,559

you know the evidence just isn't there

1392

00:51:19,270 --> 00:51:16,800

at this point but now we're moving from

1393

00:51:21,750 --> 00:51:19,280

talking about philosophy to talking

1394

00:51:23,750 --> 00:51:21,760

about the evidence i'm all for talking

1395

00:51:26,470 --> 00:51:23,760

about the evidence but i don't think

1396

00:51:28,710 --> 00:51:26,480

that's a debate that really you will

1397

00:51:30,390 --> 00:51:28,720

stand up very well in because we've

1398

00:51:33,030 --> 00:51:30,400

looked at the evidence the evidence has

1399

00:51:35,349 --> 00:51:33,040

been published the evidence isn't as

1400

00:51:38,630 --> 00:51:35,359

you've been led to believe the evidence

1401

00:51:41,990 --> 00:51:38,640

is as richard wiseman has said right

1402

00:51:45,270 --> 00:51:42,000

here that by any other area of science

1403

00:51:48,069 --> 00:51:45,280

it's proven that really is the dirty

1404

00:51:50,150 --> 00:51:48,079

dark secret here but it gets spun in a

1405

00:51:51,430 --> 00:51:50,160

different way so if you want to talk

1406

00:51:53,910 --> 00:51:51,440

about evidence we can talk about

1407

00:51:55,829 --> 00:51:53,920

evidence all day long i've talked to

1408

00:51:57,510 --> 00:51:55,839

dozens and dozens of these guys and had

1409

00:51:59,589 --> 00:51:57,520

them on the show and hashed that out

1410

00:52:00,950 --> 00:51:59,599

including yeah i mean think about that

1411

00:52:02,829 --> 00:52:00,960

think of it think think of it like this

1412

00:52:06,309 --> 00:52:02,839

suppose somebody says look

1413

00:52:08,150 --> 00:52:06,319

um i've got a i've got a machine here

1414

00:52:09,990 --> 00:52:08,160

that uh

1415

00:52:12,309 --> 00:52:10,000

that's i don't know it's it's it's

1416

00:52:14,069 --> 00:52:12,319

really good at uh lifting heavy weights

1417

00:52:15,910 --> 00:52:14,079

and we say okay

1418

00:52:17,030 --> 00:52:15,920

yeah that's that that's not particularly

1419

00:52:19,510 --> 00:52:17,040

surprising not a particularly

1420

00:52:21,750 --> 00:52:19,520

extraordinary claim we'll test it let's

1421

00:52:23,109 --> 00:52:21,760

let's produce a rig and an experiment

1422

00:52:25,670 --> 00:52:23,119

we'll test it in the lab to see if it

1423

00:52:26,630 --> 00:52:25,680

really does the thing and by golly by

1424

00:52:28,630 --> 00:52:26,640

golly

1425

00:52:30,790 --> 00:52:28,640

it does it you know it passes the test

1426

00:52:32,150 --> 00:52:30,800

okay so now this guy comes in he says

1427

00:52:34,710 --> 00:52:32,160

i've got this other machine it's

1428

00:52:36,870 --> 00:52:34,720

perpetual motion machine uh he rules it

1429

00:52:38,710 --> 00:52:36,880

in he says now just do the same

1430

00:52:40,230 --> 00:52:38,720

experiment i don't want you to change

1431

00:52:41,750 --> 00:52:40,240

anything the same standards that you

1432

00:52:43,510 --> 00:52:41,760

applied to my first machine i want you

1433

00:52:45,510 --> 00:52:43,520

to apply those exact same standards to

1434

00:52:47,990 --> 00:52:45,520

this machine and if it passes then you

1435

00:52:52,069 --> 00:52:48,000

have to tell the world that my perpetual

1436

00:52:54,630 --> 00:52:52,079

motion machine really works um i don't

1437

00:52:56,549 --> 00:52:54,640

think that would be fair

1438

00:52:58,549 --> 00:52:56,559

because the first machine doesn't is not

1439

00:53:00,470 --> 00:52:58,559

revolutionary and extraordinary in the

1440

00:53:02,630 --> 00:53:00,480

way that the second machine is that

1441

00:53:05,030 --> 00:53:02,640

second machine has to be investigated

1442

00:53:07,109 --> 00:53:05,040

much more carefully and the standards

1443

00:53:08,950 --> 00:53:07,119

applied have to be far more rigorous

1444

00:53:10,630 --> 00:53:08,960

because of the truly extraordinary

1445

00:53:12,069 --> 00:53:10,640

nature of the claim that's being

1446

00:53:13,349 --> 00:53:12,079

presented to us that's what

1447

00:53:15,109 --> 00:53:13,359

extraordinary claims require

1448

00:53:17,990 --> 00:53:15,119

extraordinary evidence means and it's

1449

00:53:20,710 --> 00:53:18,000

true well well stephen i i i just beg to

1450

00:53:23,270 --> 00:53:20,720

differ i i don't think you're intimately

1451
00:53:25,030 --> 00:53:23,280
familiar with the data dr dean rayden is

1452
00:53:27,510 --> 00:53:25,040
someone i just interviewed on the last

1453
00:53:29,109 --> 00:53:27,520
episode of skeptico i invite him to

1454
00:53:30,710 --> 00:53:29,119
contribute to think i published his

1455
00:53:32,950 --> 00:53:30,720
stuff that's great i mean here is

1456
00:53:34,870 --> 00:53:32,960
someone let's let's let's just dive into

1457
00:53:38,230 --> 00:53:34,880
dip into then a little bit of the

1458
00:53:40,470 --> 00:53:38,240
details of some data you know so he ran

1459
00:53:42,309 --> 00:53:40,480
this experiment called a pre-sentiment

1460
00:53:44,230 --> 00:53:42,319
experiment and the reason he set this up

1461
00:53:45,990 --> 00:53:44,240
is because it's a common experiment

1462
00:53:49,109 --> 00:53:46,000
that's been run on

1463
00:53:52,390 --> 00:53:49,119

freshman college students for decades

1464

00:53:54,470 --> 00:53:52,400

and that's that you hook them up to

1465

00:53:56,470 --> 00:53:54,480

some kind of biometric device various

1466

00:53:58,309 --> 00:53:56,480

different ones to measure their reaction

1467

00:54:01,510 --> 00:53:58,319

and you flash a picture on the computer

1468

00:54:03,349 --> 00:54:01,520

screen and it's either a a non

1469

00:54:05,190 --> 00:54:03,359

you know exciting picture of just a

1470

00:54:07,030 --> 00:54:05,200

pastoral scene or something like that or

1471

00:54:08,630 --> 00:54:07,040

it's something very provocative like sex

1472

00:54:10,870 --> 00:54:08,640

or violence or something like that and

1473

00:54:13,910 --> 00:54:10,880

then he wanted to measure the reaction

1474

00:54:15,190 --> 00:54:13,920

from those people what he found was a

1475

00:54:17,030 --> 00:54:15,200

reaction

1476
00:54:19,589 --> 00:54:17,040
before

1477
00:54:22,390 --> 00:54:19,599
the photo was even selected by the

1478
00:54:25,109 --> 00:54:22,400
computer it's a very small reaction but

1479
00:54:26,870 --> 00:54:25,119
it's repeatable he has repeated this

1480
00:54:29,349 --> 00:54:26,880
experiment stephen

1481
00:54:31,990 --> 00:54:29,359
uh over 50 times

1482
00:54:34,710 --> 00:54:32,000
in seven different labs it's been

1483
00:54:36,230 --> 00:54:34,720
repeated around the world and not just

1484
00:54:38,390 --> 00:54:36,240
by him

1485
00:54:41,910 --> 00:54:38,400
by other people by other people by other

1486
00:54:44,230 --> 00:54:41,920
people yes by him dozens of times by

1487
00:54:46,549 --> 00:54:44,240
other labs other than him at least nine

1488
00:54:48,790 --> 00:54:46,559

times if by the on the last count it's

1489

00:54:51,910 --> 00:54:48,800

been published in numerous peer-reviewed

1490

00:54:54,630 --> 00:54:51,920

journals so you know here is an example

1491

00:54:56,790 --> 00:54:54,640

of the kind of evidence that richard

1492

00:54:59,829 --> 00:54:56,800

wiseman is talking about when he says

1493

00:55:01,510 --> 00:54:59,839

hey by any other measure of science a

1494

00:55:04,069 --> 00:55:01,520

guy doesn't experiment repeats the

1495

00:55:06,870 --> 00:55:04,079

experiment makes the experiment public

1496

00:55:08,710 --> 00:55:06,880

this is proof it's just not accepted

1497

00:55:11,190 --> 00:55:08,720

because it doesn't fit within our

1498

00:55:13,270 --> 00:55:11,200

paradigm not because it's extraordinary

1499

00:55:15,349 --> 00:55:13,280

but because of the implications of what

1500

00:55:18,069 --> 00:55:15,359

that would mean for you talk about a

1501
00:55:21,109 --> 00:55:18,079
measurement problem okay now we have to

1502
00:55:23,109 --> 00:55:21,119
measure the fact that you are somehow

1503
00:55:25,829 --> 00:55:23,119
aware of things that are happening

1504
00:55:27,990 --> 00:55:25,839
before they happen well you can see how

1505
00:55:29,750 --> 00:55:28,000
unsettling that is to science yeah

1506
00:55:31,990 --> 00:55:29,760
extraordinary it's extraordinary climb

1507
00:55:33,670 --> 00:55:32,000
requires extraordinary evidence

1508
00:55:36,069 --> 00:55:33,680
yes yes

1509
00:55:37,990 --> 00:55:36,079
now has anyone attempted to repeat that

1510
00:55:40,790 --> 00:55:38,000
has anyone attempted to repeat that

1511
00:55:42,470 --> 00:55:40,800
experiment and failed to repeat it

1512
00:55:44,630 --> 00:55:42,480
i don't know i'm sure they i'm sure they

1513
00:55:46,630 --> 00:55:44,640

have i he he deals

1514

00:55:49,109 --> 00:55:46,640

at great length with the file drawer

1515

00:55:51,030 --> 00:55:49,119

problem i mean this guy is a very

1516

00:55:52,470 --> 00:55:51,040

accomplished

1517

00:55:54,470 --> 00:55:52,480

scientist

1518

00:55:56,230 --> 00:55:54,480

yeah i don't doubt it but

1519

00:55:58,470 --> 00:55:56,240

you know if people have attempted to

1520

00:56:00,870 --> 00:55:58,480

replicate the experiment and have not

1521

00:56:03,349 --> 00:56:00,880

received received you know got got yes

1522

00:56:05,910 --> 00:56:03,359

yes yes the file the file drawer problem

1523

00:56:09,349 --> 00:56:05,920

but you're a philosopher i am a

1524

00:56:11,190 --> 00:56:09,359

entrepreneur and a podcaster we're not

1525

00:56:13,829 --> 00:56:11,200

we're not the ones to really say you

1526

00:56:16,950 --> 00:56:13,839

know to figure out those stats he has

1527

00:56:18,710 --> 00:56:16,960

he's published them in his book uh in

1528

00:56:20,470 --> 00:56:18,720

his many books and he's talked

1529

00:56:22,230 --> 00:56:20,480

specifically about estimating what the

1530

00:56:24,230 --> 00:56:22,240

file drawer problem might be and he's

1531

00:56:25,510 --> 00:56:24,240

calculated that into his calculations

1532

00:56:27,510 --> 00:56:25,520

yeah well because i know that for

1533

00:56:29,910 --> 00:56:27,520

example chris french has attempted to

1534

00:56:31,349 --> 00:56:29,920

well has repeated experiments has failed

1535

00:56:33,030 --> 00:56:31,359

to get the result that other people have

1536

00:56:34,230 --> 00:56:33,040

got and when he's tried to publish that

1537

00:56:37,109 --> 00:56:34,240

in the peer-reviewed journals they

1538

00:56:39,829 --> 00:56:37,119

refuse and they refuse because they're

1539

00:56:41,910 --> 00:56:39,839

only interested in in in publishing uh

1540

00:56:43,829 --> 00:56:41,920

positive results not negative rules okay

1541

00:56:45,349 --> 00:56:43,839

but not the null effect the null effect

1542

00:56:47,430 --> 00:56:45,359

isn't very uh

1543

00:56:50,069 --> 00:56:47,440

newsworthy or doesn't really make it

1544

00:56:53,270 --> 00:56:50,079

into uh many journals does it

1545

00:56:54,870 --> 00:56:53,280

i got the null effect yeah yeah so so

1546

00:56:57,349 --> 00:56:54,880

look you know it may be that this can be

1547

00:56:58,470 --> 00:56:57,359

established uh i'm older i'd be very you

1548

00:57:00,309 --> 00:56:58,480

know it's extraordinary i'd love to

1549

00:57:02,150 --> 00:57:00,319

believe it was true it's very exciting

1550

00:57:05,430 --> 00:57:02,160

uh but you know the evidence is gonna

1551
00:57:07,109 --> 00:57:05,440
have to be pretty damn extraordinary uh

1552
00:57:08,789 --> 00:57:07,119
maybe it is already i don't know i'm not

1553
00:57:11,109 --> 00:57:08,799
an expert in this area i look forward to

1554
00:57:13,589 --> 00:57:11,119
seeing more of it well well you are an

1555
00:57:15,190 --> 00:57:13,599
expert in any number of things

1556
00:57:16,789 --> 00:57:15,200
including i i don't want to say you know

1557
00:57:18,470 --> 00:57:16,799
what i was just about to say this would

1558
00:57:20,069 --> 00:57:18,480
be a terrible thing you're an expert in

1559
00:57:22,870 --> 00:57:20,079
[h__\h]

1560
00:57:25,829 --> 00:57:22,880
but i mean that i mean that in a very

1561
00:57:29,190 --> 00:57:25,839
very nice way in a positive way because

1562
00:57:30,549 --> 00:57:29,200
you are the author again of this very

1563
00:57:33,190 --> 00:57:30,559

interesting book that a lot of people

1564

00:57:35,349 --> 00:57:33,200

will find useful for these kind of dorm

1565

00:57:37,510 --> 00:57:35,359

room debates that we get into whether we

1566

00:57:39,349 --> 00:57:37,520

still live in a dorm or not and that is

1567

00:57:42,150 --> 00:57:39,359

the book's title is believing [h__h]

1568

00:57:44,549 --> 00:57:42,160

how not to get sucked into an

1569

00:57:47,030 --> 00:57:44,559

intellectual black hole before we let

1570

00:57:49,030 --> 00:57:47,040

you go dr law tell us about some other

1571

00:57:51,990 --> 00:57:49,040

projects that you're working on what's

1572

00:57:53,430 --> 00:57:52,000

going on at the journal think and and

1573

00:57:54,950 --> 00:57:53,440

anything else that might be going on in

1574

00:57:56,150 --> 00:57:54,960

your world yeah well edit the journal

1575

00:57:57,910 --> 00:57:56,160

thing for the royal institute of

1576

00:57:59,829 --> 00:57:57,920

philosophy which is a journal name to

1577

00:58:01,270 --> 00:57:59,839

everyone so you know anyone and everyone

1578

00:58:02,470 --> 00:58:01,280

should be able to read it and understand

1579

00:58:04,069 --> 00:58:02,480

the stuff that's published in there we

1580

00:58:05,910 --> 00:58:04,079

try and make it accessible

1581

00:58:08,309 --> 00:58:05,920

uh and interesting to a general to the

1582

00:58:10,309 --> 00:58:08,319

general public um i've been i've been

1583

00:58:12,549 --> 00:58:10,319

working on some new children's books

1584

00:58:14,470 --> 00:58:12,559

ideas i published philosophy books for

1585

00:58:16,390 --> 00:58:14,480

children in the past probably the best

1586

00:58:17,829 --> 00:58:16,400

known one is the philosophy

1587

00:58:19,430 --> 00:58:17,839

files which i think was known as

1588

00:58:21,430 --> 00:58:19,440

philosophy rocks

1589

00:58:23,990 --> 00:58:21,440

in the united states of america

1590

00:58:25,910 --> 00:58:24,000

um in fact that's got a chapter on weird

1591

00:58:27,670 --> 00:58:25,920

and mysterious things in actually the

1592

00:58:29,670 --> 00:58:27,680

second volume of that occur the the

1593

00:58:30,549 --> 00:58:29,680

complete philosophy files

1594

00:58:32,950 --> 00:58:30,559

um

1595

00:58:34,789 --> 00:58:32,960

so i'm hoping to do a bit more work with

1596

00:58:36,549 --> 00:58:34,799

kids and critical thinking and just

1597

00:58:38,230 --> 00:58:36,559

getting them to think rigorously and

1598

00:58:40,309 --> 00:58:38,240

carefully about this stuff which i'm

1599

00:58:42,069 --> 00:58:40,319

sure you know you'd you you'd be very

1600

00:58:43,910 --> 00:58:42,079

much in favor of too you know you'd

1601
00:58:46,470 --> 00:58:43,920
agree with that absolutely don't think

1602
00:58:47,990 --> 00:58:46,480
of me as a debunker okay you think of

1603
00:58:49,430 --> 00:58:48,000
centre of inquiry as the debunking

1604
00:58:50,789 --> 00:58:49,440
organization no i'd like to think of

1605
00:58:51,990 --> 00:58:50,799
myself as just that

1606
00:58:53,910 --> 00:58:52,000
you know i there are many of these

1607
00:58:56,870 --> 00:58:53,920
claims that i would love to be true i

1608
00:58:59,510 --> 00:58:56,880
would love it to be true right that some

1609
00:59:02,470 --> 00:58:59,520
that there is some kind of precognition

1610
00:59:04,470 --> 00:59:02,480
ability that we have um because it would

1611
00:59:07,109 --> 00:59:04,480
be so exciting uh it would it would

1612
00:59:08,630 --> 00:59:07,119
completely undermine and challenge

1613
00:59:10,789 --> 00:59:08,640

so much of what we believe about how the

1614

00:59:13,990 --> 00:59:10,799

world works um it would open up new

1615

00:59:15,750 --> 00:59:14,000

vistas for us um so it's not that i'm

1616

00:59:17,829 --> 00:59:15,760

it's not that i'm in principle against

1617

00:59:19,510 --> 00:59:17,839

such beliefs it's just that before i

1618

00:59:20,950 --> 00:59:19,520

believe anything like that boy

1619

00:59:22,549 --> 00:59:20,960

somebody's gonna have to give me some

1620

00:59:24,230 --> 00:59:22,559

pretty great evidence and as you've

1621

00:59:26,230 --> 00:59:24,240

already agreed you know extraordinary

1622

00:59:27,990 --> 00:59:26,240

claims really do require pretty

1623

00:59:29,750 --> 00:59:28,000

extraordinary evidence so

1624

00:59:31,510 --> 00:59:29,760

let's get that evidence in maybe maybe

1625

00:59:34,630 --> 00:59:31,520

it's there already let's find out i'm

1626

00:59:37,349 --> 00:59:34,640

always leery of anyone who says i'd love

1627

00:59:39,589 --> 00:59:37,359

this to be true i've heard that so many

1628

00:59:42,069 --> 00:59:39,599

times i have to say in my heart of

1629

00:59:43,829 --> 00:59:42,079

hearts i don't know that i would love

1630

00:59:46,630 --> 00:59:43,839

for this to be true

1631

00:59:49,270 --> 00:59:46,640

any more than i'd love for anything else

1632

00:59:50,950 --> 00:59:49,280

that i believe in to be shown to me to

1633

00:59:54,069 --> 00:59:50,960

not be true i don't know that that's a

1634

00:59:55,910 --> 00:59:54,079

comfortable process what i know is that

1635

00:59:58,870 --> 00:59:55,920

i'm committed to

1636

01:00:01,910 --> 00:59:58,880

following the data wherever it takes me

1637

01:00:04,150 --> 01:00:01,920

and being fully open to

1638

01:00:05,430 --> 01:00:04,160

exploring the fact that i might be being

1639

01:00:07,589 --> 01:00:05,440

duped by

1640

01:00:09,829 --> 01:00:07,599

as you said in that quote that i really

1641

01:00:11,829 --> 01:00:09,839

liked either by someone else or by

1642

01:00:14,630 --> 01:00:11,839

myself into thinking something that

1643

01:00:19,270 --> 01:00:14,640

isn't true yeah you need to be very very

1644

01:00:21,589 --> 01:00:19,280

aware of that uh we need to make sure

1645

01:00:24,470 --> 01:00:21,599

that we're not led by wishful thinking

1646

01:00:26,309 --> 01:00:24,480

uh that we don't use mystery as a way of

1647

01:00:28,069 --> 01:00:26,319

immunizing our beliefs and protecting

1648

01:00:29,670 --> 01:00:28,079

what we believe against any kind of

1649

01:00:31,750 --> 01:00:29,680

intellectual threat

1650

01:00:33,510 --> 01:00:31,760

and so on it's simple for all sorts of

1651
01:00:35,349 --> 01:00:33,520
reasons not just when it comes to the

1652
01:00:36,870 --> 01:00:35,359
investigation of the paranormal so we're

1653
01:00:39,270 --> 01:00:36,880
all on board with that which is good i

1654
01:00:41,109 --> 01:00:39,280
think well dr law it's been great having

1655
01:00:42,950 --> 01:00:41,119
you on i certainly enjoyed such a

1656
01:00:44,870 --> 01:00:42,960
spirited discussion

1657
01:00:46,390 --> 01:00:44,880
and a lot of great stuff here thanks

1658
01:00:54,549 --> 01:00:46,400
again for joining me

1659
01:00:58,710 --> 01:00:56,309
thanks again to dr law for joining me

1660
01:01:01,510 --> 01:00:58,720
today on skeptico i have a couple of

1661
01:01:04,390 --> 01:01:01,520
questions i'd tee up from this interview

1662
01:01:05,430 --> 01:01:04,400
the first would be are you a biological

1663
01:01:07,109 --> 01:01:05,440

robot

1664

01:01:09,510 --> 01:01:07,119

something we talked about in this

1665

01:01:12,230 --> 01:01:09,520

interview of course this is the claim

1666

01:01:13,349 --> 01:01:12,240

made by richard dawkins that really is

1667

01:01:17,349 --> 01:01:13,359

at the

1668

01:01:20,510 --> 01:01:17,359

core the underbelly of the atheist claim

1669

01:01:23,910 --> 01:01:20,520

and that's that you are a machine an

1670

01:01:26,789 --> 01:01:23,920

electrochemical robot that is driven by

1671

01:01:30,470 --> 01:01:26,799

genetic instincts and environmental

1672

01:01:33,030 --> 01:01:30,480

programming and you are nothing more so

1673

01:01:35,270 --> 01:01:33,040

to me that seems absolutely absurd i

1674

01:01:37,910 --> 01:01:35,280

think the philosophical argument for

1675

01:01:40,390 --> 01:01:37,920

that is absurd but i'd love to hear

1676

01:01:41,589 --> 01:01:40,400

someone come forward and explain how

1677

01:01:44,230 --> 01:01:41,599

they are

1678

01:01:46,230 --> 01:01:44,240

a biological robot and that they accept

1679

01:01:48,390 --> 01:01:46,240

that and that's how they live their life

1680

01:01:50,630 --> 01:01:48,400

i'd love to hear from you i hope you

1681

01:01:53,670 --> 01:01:50,640

join us and answer that question

1682

01:01:55,750 --> 01:01:53,680

in the affirmative so we can talk to you

1683

01:01:58,069 --> 01:01:55,760

and the second question since we spent

1684

01:02:00,390 --> 01:01:58,079

so much time talking about it in this

1685

01:02:02,950 --> 01:02:00,400

interview is does it make any sense from

1686

01:02:05,670 --> 01:02:02,960

a from a philosophy of science

1687

01:02:08,230 --> 01:02:05,680

perspective to proclaim that

1688

01:02:10,950 --> 01:02:08,240

extraordinary claims require

1689

01:02:13,510 --> 01:02:10,960

extraordinary proof now you know my

1690

01:02:15,829 --> 01:02:13,520

opinion on this not only from this show

1691

01:02:17,829 --> 01:02:15,839

but from many previous shows but it was

1692

01:02:20,870 --> 01:02:17,839

interesting to joust a little bit with

1693

01:02:22,150 --> 01:02:20,880

dr law on this and hash it out once

1694

01:02:24,710 --> 01:02:22,160

again so i'd love to get your

1695

01:02:27,270 --> 01:02:24,720

perspective on that is there a way to

1696

01:02:30,230 --> 01:02:27,280

reasonably support that claim that

1697

01:02:32,710 --> 01:02:30,240

somehow extraordinary claims require

1698

01:02:35,270 --> 01:02:32,720

this level of extraordinary proof would

1699

01:02:37,430 --> 01:02:35,280

love to hear your opinion on that as

1700

01:02:39,510 --> 01:02:37,440

well as on the first question of course

1701

01:02:43,030 --> 01:02:39,520

the place to do that is at the skeptico

1702

01:02:45,750 --> 01:02:43,040

website at s-k-e-p-t-i-k

1703

01:02:47,670 --> 01:02:45,760

don't forget the k-o.com while you're

1704

01:02:49,910 --> 01:02:47,680

there you can drop us a comment right

1705

01:02:51,910 --> 01:02:49,920

there on the website click and bounce

1706

01:02:54,470 --> 01:02:51,920

over to the forum where there's usually

1707

01:02:56,710 --> 01:02:54,480

a lot going on or drop me an email or

1708

01:02:58,710 --> 01:02:56,720

connect with me on facebook while you're

1709

01:03:01,990 --> 01:02:58,720

at the skeptical website be sure to

1710

01:03:03,829 --> 01:03:02,000

check out over our 200 previous episodes

1711

01:03:05,750 --> 01:03:03,839

lots of good stuff in there it's all

1712

01:03:07,829 --> 01:03:05,760

free available for download from the

1713

01:03:10,470 --> 01:03:07,839

website and i always love to hear from

1714

01:03:12,710 --> 01:03:10,480

listeners who discover skeptico and then

1715

01:03:15,029 --> 01:03:12,720

are and then are inspired to dig into

1716

01:03:17,270 --> 01:03:15,039

some of those old episodes i have to say

1717

01:03:19,270 --> 01:03:17,280

i do the same thing when i find a

1718

01:03:21,670 --> 01:03:19,280

podcast that i'm really turned on to

1719

01:03:23,670 --> 01:03:21,680

that i didn't know before it's a great

1720

01:03:25,190 --> 01:03:23,680

surprise to find that there's so many

1721

01:03:27,990 --> 01:03:25,200

preview shows that i can go back and

1722

01:03:30,549 --> 01:03:28,000

listen to i really enjoy doing that and

1723

01:03:32,390 --> 01:03:30,559

of course i enjoy it when someone finds

1724

01:03:34,630 --> 01:03:32,400

skeptico and goes through the same

1725

01:03:36,309 --> 01:03:34,640

process so if that's you i'll welcome

1726

01:03:38,630 --> 01:03:36,319

you to do it i have a number of

1727

01:03:39,990 --> 01:03:38,640

interesting shows coming up on skeptico

1728

01:03:42,309 --> 01:03:40,000

they're coming along at a pretty good

1729

01:03:44,710 --> 01:03:42,319

pace and they're certainly not slowing

1730

01:03:47,029 --> 01:03:44,720

down i'll have to see how i do keeping

1731

01:03:49,750 --> 01:03:47,039

up but i'll do my best but that's going